

ITEM NO.501

COURT NO.1

SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 55/2019

JANHIT ABHIYAN

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA

Respondent(s)

([FOR DIRECTIONS])

WITH T.P.(C) No. 1245/2019 (XVI-A)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.97310/2019-STAY APPLICATION)
 T.P.(C) No. 2715/2019 (XVI-A)
 T.P.(C) No. 122/2020 (XVI-A)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.12236/2020-STAY APPLICATION)
 T.C.(C) No. 8/2021 (XVI-A)
 W.P.(C) No. 596/2019 (X)
 (FOR impleading party ON IA 87113/2019)
 W.P.(C) No. 446/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION)
 W.P.(C) No. 427/2019 (X)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.55546/2019-EX-PARTE STAY
 IA No. 55546/2019 - EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 343/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.45038/2019-EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 331/2019 (X)
 W.P.(C) No. 798/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.91170/2019-EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 732/2019 (PIL-W)
 W.P.(C) No. 73/2019 (PIL-W)
 (IA No. 12600/2019 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL
 DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES
 IA No. 12602/2019 - STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 72/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.12370/2019-STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 76/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.13320/2019-STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 69/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.11705/2019-STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 80/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.13950/2019-PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE
 IN PERSON)
 W.P.(C) No. 122/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION)
 W.P.(C) No. 106/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION)
 W.P.(C) No. 222/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.33408/2019-STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 133/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.21662/2019-EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 249/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.35491/2019-EX-PARTE STAY and IA
 No.35492/2019-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)
 W.P.(C) No. 212/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.32228/2019-STAY APPLICATION and IA
 No.32231/2019-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)
 W.P.(C) No. 162/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION)
 W.P.(C) No. 341/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION)
 W.P.(C) No. 419/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.54583/2019-EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 854/2019 (PIL-W)
 (WITH IA No. 85373/2019 - STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 473/2020 (X)
 SLP(C) No. 8699/2020 (XV)
 (FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.65946/2020-EXEMPTION FROM FILING
 C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT and IA No.65948/2020-EXEMPTION FROM
 FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No.65949/2020-PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL
 DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)
 T.C.(C) No. 10/2021 (XVI-A)
 T.C.(C) No. 7/2021 (XVI-A)
 T.C.(C) No. 9/2021 (XVI-A)
 T.C.(C) No. 12/2021 (XVI-A)
 T.C.(C) No. 11/2021 (XVI-A)
 W.P.(C) No. 182/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION)
 W.P.(C) No. 178/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.28123/2019-EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 168/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.26432/2019-EX-PARTE STAY)
 W.P.(C) No. 95/2019 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.15973/2019-STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 146/2019 (X)
 (With IA No. 23606/2019 - STAY APPLICATION)
 W.P.(C) No. 493/2019 (PIL-W)
 (with IA No. 62215/2019 - STAY APPLICATION)

Date : 08-09-2022 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE
 HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DINESH MAHESHWARI
 HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE S. RAVINDRA BHAT
 HON'BLE MS. JUSTICE BELA M. TRIVEDI
 HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.B. PARDIWALA

Counsel for the parties

Mr. Yadav Narendra Singh, AOR
Mr. Ashutosh Yadav, Adv.

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Ld. AG
Mr. Tushar Mehta, Ld. SG
Mr. Sanjay Jain, Ld. ASG
Mr. R. Bala Subramanian, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Shraddha Deshmukh, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Talwar, Adv.
Mr. Kanu Agarwal, Adv.
Ms. Chinmaee Chandra, Adv.
Mr. Apurva Kurup, Adv.
Mr. Padmesh Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Vanshja Shukla, Adv.
Ms. Sujatha Bagadhi, Adv.
Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR
Mr. Digvijay Dam, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, ASG
Mr. Aman Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Manvendra Singh, Adv.
Ms./Mr. L.N. Shivani, Adv.
Ms. Shivika Mehra, Adv.
Ms. Shagun Thakur, Adv.
Ms. Poornima Singh, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Jain, Adv.
Mr. A.K. Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Vanshaja Shukla, AOR
Mr./Ms. Sajal Singhai, Adv.

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Ld. AG
Mr. Tushar Mehta, Ld. SG
Mr. Sanjay Jain, Ld. ASG
Mr. Padmesh Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Sudhansu Palo, AOR
Ms./Mr. Ipsita B., Adv.
Mr. Rajkumar Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Budhadev Palo, Adv.
Ms. Padmaja Choudhury, Adv.
Mr. Narayan Mani, Adv.

Mr. Nirmal Kumar Ambastha, AOR
Ms. Ashmita Bisarya, Adv.

Mr. Bijender S. Chaudhry, Adv.
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. S.K. Rajora, Adv.
Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv.
Ms. Deepti Hooda, Adv.

Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR

Prof.(Dr.) G. Mohan Gopal, Adv.
Mr. Shishir Pinaki, Adv.
Mr. Muzaffar Khan, Adv.
Mr. Bijendra Mishra, Adv.
Mr. V. Ramchander Goud, Adv.
Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR

Dr. M.P. Raju, Adv.
Mr. M. Vijaya Bhaskar, AOR
Mr. Ravi Prakash, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Chauhan, Adv.
Dr. K. Elumalai, Adv.
Mr. Ajit Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Pratik R. Bombarde, AOR
Mr. Reepak Kansal, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Renjith B. Marar, Adv.
Mr. Zulfiker Ali P. S, AOR

Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR

Mr. P. A. Noor Muhamed, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Kumar, AOR

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Anupama N., Adv.
Mr. W. Inmanuel Meitei, Adv.

Petitioner-in-person

Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR

Mr. V.N. Raghupathy, AOR

Mr. Shadan Farasat, AOR
Ms. Hrishika Jain, Adv.
Mr. Ujwala Uppaluri, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Shourya Dasgupta, Adv.
Mr. Aman Naqvi, Adv.
Mr. Dhruv Bhatnagar, Adv.
Mr. Nitesh, Adv.

Mr. Tripurari Rai, Adv.
Mr. Varun Thakur, Adv.
Mr. B Rajesh Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Varinder Kr. Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Sachin Patil, Adv.
Mr. Geo Joseph, Adv.
Mr. Durgesh Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Kailas Bajirao Autade, AOR

Mr. Saurabh Mishra, AAG
Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR

Mr. Namit Saxena, AOR

Mrs. Niranjana Singh, AOR
Ms. Somyashree, Adv.
Ms. Sarvshree, Adv.

Mr. Dinesh P. Rajbhar, Adv.
Ms. Anzu. K. Varkey, AOR

Mr. Himanshu Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. Piyush Negi, Adv.
Mr. Saurabh Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Disha Mittal, Adv.

Mr. Akash Kakade, Adv.
Mr. Somanatha Padhan, AOR
Mr. Mir Nagman Ali, Adv.
Mr. Akash S. Tiwari, Adv.
Mr. Neelmani Pant, Adv.
Miss Sukhada Kakade, Adv.
Mr. Swetab Kakade, Adv.
Mr. Swetab Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Ajit Kumar Ekka, AOR
Mr. R.S.M. Kalky, Adv.
Mr. S.P. Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sunil Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Ramesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. K.K.L. Gautam, Adv.
Ms. Saroj Bala, Adv.
Ms. Arundhati Chakroborty, Adv.
Ms. Vaishali Nariyala, Adv.
Mr. Kaushal Jeet Kait, Adv.
Mr. Kritagya Kumar Kait, Adv.
Mr. Sangh Sankalp Kaushal, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Mohod, Adv.
Ms. Vasundhara Rana, Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Malhotra, AOR

Mr. Abhisar Thakral, Adv.
Mr. Raunak Vattsya, Adv.
Mr. Milind Singh, Adv.
Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR

Mr. Maninder Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, Adv.
Mr. Arnav Singh Deo, Adv.
Mr. Prabhash Bajaj, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Sabharwal, Adv.
Ms. Ashita Chawla, Adv.
Mr. Raghav Tewari, Adv.

Ms. Meenakshi Arora, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Prasanna S., Adv.
Mr. Rahul Narayan, AOR

Mr. Jayant Muthraj, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Mahvilka Jayant, Adv.
Ms. Ranji Ohri Lal, Adv.
Mr. Yaduinder Lal, Adv.
Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR

Mr. Roy Abraham, Adv.
Ms. Reena Roy, Adv.
Ms. Seema Jain, Adv.
Mr. Akhil Abraham Roy, Adv.
Mr. Yaduinder Lal, Adv.
Ms. Rajni Ohri Lal, Adv.
Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR

Dr. M.P. Raju, Adv.
Mr. S. S. Nehra, AOR
Mr. Rajendra Verma, Adv.
Mr. Arun Dagar, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Nehra, Adv.
Mr. P.I. Jose, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR
Ms. Jhanvi Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Ishita Chowdhury, Adv.
Ms. Shivani Vij, Adv.
Ms. Tanya Srivastava, Adv.
Ms. Aditi Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Vishnu Sharma, AOR

Mr. P. Wilson, Sr. Adv.
Mr. R. Nedumaran, AOR
Mr. Arijeet Singh, Adv.
Mr. Apoorv Malhotra, Adv.

Mr. ADN Rao, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Chauhan, Adv.

Mr. Amit P. Shahi, Adv.
Ms. Rajshri A. Dubey, Adv.
Mr. D. Shiva Shankar, Adv.
Ms. Agramma Singla, Adv.
Ms. Ritambhara, Adv.
Mr. H.B. Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Annam Venkatesh, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Parikh, Adv.
Mr. Shashank Singh, AOR
Mr. Adil Sharfuddin, Adv.
Ms. Disha Wadekar, Adv.
Mr. Anupam Chaudhary, Adv.
Mr. Satwik Parikh, Adv.
Mr. Mubarak Ali, Adv.
Mr. Mohd. Asad Khan, Adv.

Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR
Ms. Swathi H. Prasad, Adv.
Ms. Ria Sachthey, Adv.
Mr. Chetanya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amlendu Kumar Akhilesh Kumar Jha, Adv.
Mr. Ranjeet Bharti, Adv.
Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, Adv.
Ms. Rubina Jawed, Adv.
Ms. Vijay Lakshmi, Adv.
Mr. Parthsarathi M. Saraf, Adv.

Mrs. Naghma Imtiaz, Adv.
Mr. Ahmed Zargham, Adv.
Mr. Saif Naseem, Adv.
For M/s Equity Lex Associates, AOR

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, AOR

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR

Mr. Siddharath Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Aaditya A. Pande, AOR
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.

Mr. D. Kumanan, AOR
Mr. Sheikh F. Kalia, Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Sharma, AOR
Mr. Dhawal Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Bhatia, Adv.
Ms. Tushika Goel, Adv.

Ms. Savita Singh, AOR

Mr. K. V. Mohan, AOR

Mr. K.V. Balakrishnan, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Intervenor-in-person

Ms. Diya Kapur, Adv.
Ms. Liz Mathew, AOR

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Chauhan, Adv.
Mr. Amit P. Shahi, Adv.
Ms. Rajshri A. Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar, Adv.
Mr. H.B. Dubey, Adv.

Mr. S. Niranjan Reddy, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Mahfooz A. Nazki, AOR
Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.
Mr. Shaik Mohamad Haneef, Adv.
Mr. T. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.
Mr. K.V. Girish Chowdary, Adv.
Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv.
Ms. Akhila Palem, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Sahil Raveen, Adv.

Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Mr. Tushar Mehta, SGI
Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Mr. A. Karthik, AOR

Mr. Somya Chakarborty, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Lal Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Umesh Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. R. C. Kohli, AOR

Mr. Kaleeswaram Raj, Adv.
Mr. Mohammed Sadique T.a., AOR
Mrs. Anu K. Joy, Adv.
Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.
Ms. Thulasi K. Raj, Adv.

Mr. V.K. Biju, AOR
Ms. Swathi H. Prasad, Adv.
Ms. Ria Sachthey, Adv.
Mr. Chetanya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amlendu Kumar Akhilesh Kumar Jha, Adv.
Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Ranjeet Bharti, Adv.

Ms. Rubina Jawed, Adv.

Mr. K.K.L. Gautam, Adv.

Ms. Saroj Bala, Adv.

Ms. Arundhati Chakroborty, Adv.

Ms. Vaishali Nariyala, Adv.

Mr. Kaushal Jeet Kait, Adv.

Mr. Kritagya Kumar Kait, Adv.

Mr. Rahul Mohod, Adv.

Ms. Vasundhara Rana, Adv.

Mr. Manoj Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Malhotra, AOR

Mr. Subodh S. Patil, AOR

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

In keeping with the observations made on the last occasion, learned counsel appearing for parties have suggested certain issues which have been compiled by Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, learned Senior Counsel. The issues suggested by Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned Attorney General for India are as follows :

(1) Whether the 103rd Constitution Amendment can be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution by permitting the State to make special provisions, including reservation, based on economic criteria?

(2) Whether the 103rd Constitution Amendment can be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution by permitting the State to make special provisions in relation to admission to private unaided institutions?

(3) Whether the 103rd Constitution Amendment can be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution in excluding the SEBCs/OBCs/SCs/STs from the scope of EWS

reservation?

(4) Whether the cap of 50% referred to in earlier decisions of the Supreme Court can be considered to be a part of the basic structure of the Constitution? If so, can the 103rd Constitution Amendment be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution?

Some other facets of the matter are also touched upon and presented through additional issues by the other learned counsel. In an attempt to crystalize and capture every facet of the issues so suggested by the learned counsel, Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, learned Senior Counsel, in turn, has proposed the following three issues :-

(1) Whether the 103rd Constitution Amendment can be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution by permitting the State to make special provisions, including reservation, based on economic criteria?

(2) Whether the 103rd Constitution Amendment can be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution by :

- a) infringing the Equality Code by discriminating, and promoting the very classes which led to quotas in the first place?
- b) excluding the SEBCs/OBCs/SCs/STs from the scope of EWS reservation?
- c) crossing the 50% ceiling limit for reservations?
- d) allowing unbridled power to the States to classify the EWS?
- e) making special provisions in relation to admissions to private unaided institutions?

f) providing protection for a class other than the one referred to in Article 46 of the Constitution of India?

(3) Whether the 103rd Constitution Amendment can be said to breach the basic structure of the Constitution by not allowing for traditional reservation guardrails (exclusion of creamy layer, backwardness, quantifiable data on inadequacy of representation, effect on efficiency)?

Having considered the matter, in our view, first three issues suggested by Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned Attorney General for India, are the main issues which arise in the matter. Whatever has been suggested through other issues by the learned counsel is in the nature of supplementing and substantiating the propositions emerging from said three issues suggested by the learned Attorney General.

We shall therefore be proceeding with the hearing with respect to first three issues suggested by the learned Attorney General. Learned counsel appearing for various parties are however welcome to advance their submissions touching upon other facets in aid of said three issues.

We have been given to understand that written submissions filed by the learned counsel appearing for the parties have already been compiled and shared with all the learned counsel appearing for the parties.

The applicants who have moved intervention applications may also file their written submissions and learned counsel appearing for such parties may also address us orally. However, they shall not repeat any submissions advanced earlier.

Let the matters be listed for final hearing on 13.09.2022 at 10.30 A.M.

(SANJAY KUMAR-II)
ASTT. REGISTRAR-cum-PS

(VIRENDER SINGH)
BRANCH OFFICER