

ITEM NO.501

COURT NO.1

SECTION X

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s).493/2022

SUBHASH DESAI

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

PRINCIPAL SECRETARY, GOVERNOR OF MAHARASHTRA &amp; ORS. Respondent(s)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.92215/2022-STAY APPLICATION and IA No.92217/2022-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.92216/2022-PERMISSION TO FILE LENGTHY LIST OF DATES, IA No. 100297/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS, IA No. 108739/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

WITH

W.P.(C) No. 469/2022 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.88601/2022-STAY APPLICATION and IA No.88602/2022-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.88964/2022-APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS, IA No. 89960/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION)

W.P.(C) No. 468/2022 (X)

(WITH IA No. 88604/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., IA No. 88603/2022 - STAY APPLICATION)

W.P.(C) No. 470/2022 (X)

(WITH IA No. 88697/2022 - EX-PARTE STAY)

W.P.(C) No. 479/2022 (X)

(WITH IA No. 90188/2022 - EX-PARTE STAY, IA No. 90189/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

W.P.(C) No. 538/2022 (X)

(WITH IA No. 100285/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS, IA No. 98578/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., IA No. 98577/2022 - STAY APPLICATION)

Date : 16-03-2023 These petitions were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE M.R. SHAH

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE KRISHNA MURARI

HON'BLE MS. JUSTICE HIMA KOHLI

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE PAMIDIGHANTAM SRI NARASIMHA

For Petitioner(s)  
WP C 493/22

Mr. Kapil Sibal, Sr. Adv.  
Dr. Abhishek Manu Singhvi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Devadatt Kamat, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Amit Anand Tiwari, Adv.  
Mr. Rohit Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Rajesh Inamdar, Adv.  
Mr. Javedur Rahman, Adv.  
Mr. Nizam Pasha, Adv.  
Mr. Anish R. Shah, AOR  
Mr. Harsh Pandey, Adv.  
Mr. Revanta Solanki, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Bhandari, Adv.  
Mr. Sunny Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Nishant Patil, Adv.  
Ms. Devyani Gupta, Adv.  
Ms. Tanvi Anand, Adv.  
Ms. Aprajita Jamwal, Adv.

WP C 470/22  
WP C 479/22  
WP C 538/22

Mr. Kapil Sibal, Sr. Adv.  
Dr. Abhishek Manu Singhvi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Devadatt Kamat, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Rohit Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Anand Tiwari, Adv.  
Mr. Javedur Rahman, AOR  
Mr. Rajesh Inamdar, Adv.  
Mr. Sunny Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Dharmendra Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Bhandari, Adv.  
Mr. Nizam Pasha, Adv.  
Mr. Harsh Pandey, Adv.  
Mr. Revanta Solanki, Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Kaushik, Adv.  
Ms. Aparajita Jamwal, Adv.  
Mr. Nikhil Purohit, Adv.  
Mr. Ashok Kumar, Adv.  
Ms. Devyani Gupta, Adv.  
Ms. Tanvi Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Seem, Adv.  
Mr. L. Nidhiram Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Aman Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Ashima Chauhan Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Mudassir, Adv.

WP C 468/22

Mr. Neeraj Kishan Kaul, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Maninder Singh, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Abhikalp Pratap Singh, AOR  
Mr. Abhay Anturkar, Adv.  
Mr. Prabhas Bajaj, Adv.  
Mr. Dhruv Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Ira Mahajan, Adv.  
Mr. Raghav Agrawal, Adv.  
Mr. Toshiv Goyal, Adv.

Ms. Manmeet Kaur Sareen, Adv.  
 Mr. Navneet R, Adv.  
 Ms. Shreya Saxena, Adv.  
 Ms. Yamini Singh, Adv.  
 Ms. Pritha Suri, Adv.  
 Mr. Rangaran Mohan, Adv.  
 Mr. Ramchandran Madan, Adv.  
 Ms. Vijetha Ravi, Adv.  
 Mr. Ajay Sabharwal, Adv.

WP C 469/22

Mr. Harish Salve, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Neeraj Kishan Kaul, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Mahesh Jethmalani, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Maninder Singh, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Sr. Adv.  
 Ms. Malvika Trivedi, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Chirag Shah, Adv.  
 Mr. Utsav Trivedi, Adv.  
 Mr. Ravi Sharma, Adv.  
 Mr. Himanshu Sachdeva, Adv.  
 Ms. Manini Roy, Adv.  
 Ms. Shivani Bhushan, Adv.  
 Mr. Nihar Thackeray, Adv.  
 Ms. Ira Mahajan, Adv.  
 Mr. Dhruv Sharma, Adv.  
 Mr. Raghav Agarwal, Adv.  
 Ms. Mugdha Pande, Adv.  
 Mr. Ajay Awasthi, Adv.  
 Mr. Prabhash Bajaj, Adv.  
 Mr. Navneet R, Adv.  
 Mr. Piyush Tiwari, Adv.  
 Ms. Shrishti Kumar, Adv.  
 Mr. Kumar Sumit, Adv.  
 Ms. Chaitali Jugran, Adv.  
 Ms. Kanjani Sharma, Adv.  
 Ms. Pracheta Kar, Adv.  
 Mr. Aditya Sidhra, Adv.  
 Mr. Nadeem Afroz, Adv.  
 Ms. Sujal Gupta, Adv.  
 Mr. Wedo Khalo, Adv.  
 Mr. Anjani Kumar Rai, Adv.  
 Mr. Biswaksen Panda, Adv.  
 M/S. Tas Law, AOR

For Respondent(s)

Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG  
 Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.  
 Mr. Madhav Sinhal, Adv.  
 Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. Neeraj Kishan Kaul, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Maninder Singh, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Abhikalp Pratap Singh, AOR

Mr. Abhay Anturkar, Adv.  
Mr. Prabhas Bajaj, Adv.  
Mr. Dhruv Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Ira Mahajan, Adv.  
Mr. Ramchandra Madan, Adv.  
Mr. Raghav Agrawal, Adv.  
Mr. Toshiv Goyal, Adv.  
Mr. Raghav Agarwal, Adv.  
Ms. Yamini Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Shreya Saxena, Adv.  
Ms. Pritha Suri, Adv.  
Ms. Vijetha Ravi, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Sabharwal, Adv.  
Ms. Ajay Sabharwal, Adv.  
Mr. Rang saran Mohan, Adv.  
Mr. Ramchandran Madan, Adv.  
Mr. Navneet R, Adv.  
Ms. Manmeet Kaur Sareen, Adv.

Mr. Harish Salve, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Neeraj Kishan Kaul, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Mahesh Jethmalani, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Maninder Singh, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Malvika Trivedi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Chirag Shah, Adv.  
Mr. Utsav Trivedi, Adv.  
Mr. Ravi Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Himanshu Sachdeva, Adv.  
Ms. Manini Roy, Adv.  
Ms. Shivani Bhushan, Adv.  
Mr. Nihar Thackeray, Adv.  
Ms. Ira Mahajan, Adv.  
Mr. Dhruv Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Raghav Agarwal, Adv.  
Ms. Mugdha Pande, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Awasthi, Adv.  
Mr. Prabhash Bajaj, Adv.  
Mr. Navneet R, Adv.  
Mr. Piyush Tiwari, Adv.  
Ms. Shrishti Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Kumar Sumit, Adv.  
Ms. Chaitali Jugran, Adv.  
Ms. Kanjani Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Pracheta Kar, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Sidhra, Adv.  
Mr. Nadeem Afroz, Adv.  
Ms. Sujal Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Wedo Khalo, Adv.  
Mr. Anjani Kumar Rai, Adv.  
Mr. Biswaksen Panda, Adv.  
M/S. Tas Law, AOR

Mr. Pai Amit, AOR  
Ms. Pankhuri Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Ranu Purohit, Adv.  
Ms. Bhavana Duhoon, Adv.  
Mr. Abhiyudaya Vats, Adv.

Ms. Astha Prasad, AOR  
Ms. Rukmini Bobde, Adv.  
Ms. Trishala Trivedi, Adv.  
Mr. Ankit Ambasta, Adv.  
Mr. Chirag Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Ajit Pravin Wagh, Adv.

Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR  
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.  
Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.

Mr. Javedur Rahman, AOR

Mr. Ankit Yadav, AOR  
Ms. Prakriti Rastogi, Adv.

Mr. Asim Sarode, Adv.  
Ms. Shriya Awale, Adv.  
Ms. Smita Singalkar, Adv.  
Mr. Ashok Kumar Gupta Ii, AOR  
Mr. Pradeep Kumar Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Kailash Prashad Pandey, AOR  
Mr. Mahendra Kawchale, Adv.  
Mr. Vijay Pal, Adv.  
Mr. Pramod Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Kundal Lal, Adv.  
Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Umang Tripathi, Adv.  
Mr. Deepankar, Adv.  
Mr. Om Prakash, Adv.  
Ms. Rekha Agarwal, Adv.  
Mr. Karunesh Kumar Shukla, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Garg, Adv.

Mr. Sadashiv, AOR  
Dr. AP Singh, Adv.  
Mr. VP Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Richa Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Geeta Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Sharwan Kumar Goyal, Adv.

Dr. Gunratan Sadavarte, Adv.  
Mr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Pawan Kumar Shukla, Adv.  
Mr. S.C.tripathi, Adv.

**Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.  
Mr. Kamal Kumar Pandey, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Belsare, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Singh Rana, AOR**

**Mr. T. R. B. Sivakumar, AOR  
Mr. Shreyas Gacche, Adv.  
Mr. Rajsaheb Patil, Adv.  
Ms. Supriya Wankhede, Adv.**

**UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R**

- 1 We have heard Mr Kapil Sibal, Dr Abhishek Manu Singhvi and Mr Devadatt Kamat, senior counsel on one side, Mr Harish Salve, Mr Neeraj Kishan Kaul, Mr Maninder Singh and Mr Mahesh Jethmalani, senior counsel for the other side and Mr Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General of India, on behalf of the Governor of the State of Maharashtra.
- 2 Arguments concluded.
- 3 Judgment reserved.

**(SANJAY KUMAR-I)  
DEPUTY REGISTRAR**

**(SAROJ KUMARI GAUR)  
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR**