

ITEM NO.5

COURT NO.8

SECTION X

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 1022/1989

ALL INDIA JUDGES ASSOCIATION & ORS.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(ONLY IA NOS.23985 OF 2023 AND I.A. Nos. 121642/2018, I.A. No.5933/23 in I.A. NO.121642/2018, I.A. No.162247/2018, 162248/2018, 162199/2018, and 162201/2018 and IA Nos. 93974 of 2019, 72900, 73015, 40695 and 50269 of 2021 and 201893 of 2022 TO BE LISTED AS PER COURT'S ORDER DATED 28.02.2023 ALONGWITH I.A. NOS.77008/2020, 77010/2020, 44673/2020, 44677/2020, 91093/2022 AND 91089/2022 SHALL ALSO BE LISTED ON THAT DAY AS PER COURT'S ORDER DATED 24.03.2023

IA No. 50269/2022 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION  
IA No. 5933/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS  
IA No. 44677/2020 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS  
IA No. 121642/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION  
IA No. 91093/2022 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION  
IA No. 93974/2019 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION  
IA No. 162248/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION  
IA No. 72900/2021 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION  
IA No. 162201/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION  
IA No. 77008/2020 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION  
IA No. 162247/2018 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION  
IA No. 23985/2023 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION  
IA No. 162199/2018 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION  
IA No. 91089/2022 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT  
IA No. 40695/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT  
IA No. 201893/2022 - MODIFICATION  
IA No. 73015/2021 - MODIFICATION OF COURT ORDER  
IA No. 77010/2020 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON)

Date : 25-04-2023 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM : HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B.R. GAVAI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE VIKRAM NATH  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJAY KAROL

Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Sr. Adv, Amicus Curiae  
Mr. Ankit Yadav, AOR

Ms. Pracheta Kar, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Sidhra, Adv.  
Mr. Nadeem Afroz, Adv.  
Ms. Prakriti Rastogi, Adv.

**For Petitioner(s)**

Mr. Akhilesh Kumar Pandey, AOR  
Mrs. Amita Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Rakesh Dahiya, AOR  
Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, AOR  
Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, AOR  
Mr. Pravir Kumar Jain, AOR

**For Respondent(s)**

Ms. A. Subhashini, AOR  
Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR  
Mr. Ajay Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Satish Kumar, AOR  
Mr. T. V. Ratnam, AOR

Mr. Arjun Garg, AOR  
Mr. Aakash Nandolia, Adv.  
Ms. Sagun Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. Apoorv Kurup, AOR  
Ms. Swati Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Kirti Dadheech, Adv.

Mr. Sibho Sankar Mishra, AOR  
Mrs. Prabhati Nayak, Adv.  
Mr. Niranjana Sahu, Adv.  
Ms. Apoorva Sharma, Adv.

Ms. G. Indira, AOR

Mr. Anandh Kannan N., AOR

Mr. Gopal Jha, AOR  
Mr. Shreyash Bhardwaj, Adv.

Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR  
Mr. Karan Bharihoke, AOR  
Mr. M. A. Chinnasamy, AOR  
Mr. P. K. Jain, AOR  
Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR  
Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR

Dr. Sushil Balwada, AOR  
Mr. Sharan Dev Singh Thakur, Adv.  
Mr. Mahesh Thakur, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Thakur, Adv.  
Mr. Bishwendra Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Mustafa Sajad, Adv.  
Mr. Sandiv Kalia, Adv.

Mr. Arun K. Sinha, AOR  
Mr. Parijat Sinha, AOR

M/S. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR  
Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv.  
Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv.

Mrs. Anjani Aiyagari, AOR  
Mr. K.sriram, Adv.  
Dr. M.tirupathi Reddy, Adv.  
Mr. Rakesh Kumar, Adv.

M/S. Corporate Law Group, AOR  
Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR  
Mr. Naresh K. Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Anil Nag, AOR  
Mr. Kishan Datta, AOR  
Mr. Romy Chacko, AOR  
Ms. A. Sumathi, AOR

Mr. K M Nataraj, A.S.G.  
Mr. Wasim Quadari, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. T A Khan, Adv.  
Mr. B K Satija, Adv.  
Mr. Nalin Kohli, Adv.  
Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. Amit Anand Tiwari, AAG  
Mr. Sabarish subramanian, Adv.  
Deyani Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Vishnu Unnikrishnan, Adv.  
Mr. Naman Dwivedi, Adv.  
Ms. Shivani Jena, Adv.  
Mr. Kranthi Kumar, Adv.

M/S. Gagrat And Co, AOR

Mr. Pravir Choudhary, AOR  
Mr. Reepak Kansal, Adv.  
Mr. Prince Arora, Adv.  
Ms. Priyambika Jha, Adv.  
Mr. Tarun Suneja, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Kapoor, Adv.

Ms. N. Annapoorani, AOR

Mr. V. K. Sidharthan, AOR  
Mr. Manish K. Bishnoi, AOR  
Mr. M. Veerappa, AOR  
Mrs. V. D. Khanna, AOR  
Mr. Mukesh K. Giri, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Jain, AOR  
Mr. Sajjan Singh Nahar, Adv.

Mr. T. V. George, AOR  
Mr. K. Ram Kumar, AOR

Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR  
Ms. Swathi H. Prasad, Adv.

Mr. Chander Shekhar Ashri, AOR  
Mr. Ratan Kumar Choudhuri, AOR  
Mr. Alok Kumar, AOR  
Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR  
Mr. T. L. Garg, AOR  
Dr. J. P. Dhanda, AOR

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR  
Mr. Manendra Pal Gupta, Adv.

Mr. T. Harish Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR  
Mr. S. R. Setia, AOR

Mr. Krishnanand Pandeya, AOR

Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Sanjay Sharawat, AOR  
Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR  
Mr. S. K. Bhattacharya, AOR

Mrs. D. Bharathi Reddy, AOR

Ms. Meera Mathur, AOR  
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR  
Mr. G. Prakash, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR  
Ms. Rashika Swarup, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Nishant Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR  
Mr. Abhish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Surya Kant, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR  
Mr. Shantwanu Sigh, Adv.  
Ms. Pragya Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Sunny Sing, Adv.  
Mr. Akshay Singh, Adv.

Ms. Kumud Lata Das, AOR  
Mr. Harsh Ajay Singh, Adv.

Mr. P. V. Dinesh, AOR  
Mr. Gopal Balwant Sathe, AOR  
Mr. R. Sathish, AOR  
Mrs. Revathy Raghavan, AOR  
Mr. Rajiv Mehta, AOR  
Mr. P. V. Yogeswaran, AOR  
Mrs. Bina Gupta, AOR  
Mr. R. N. Keswani, AOR  
Mr. Jitendra Mohan Sharma, AOR

Mr. James P. Thomas, Adv.  
Mr. P. I. Jose, AOR

Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR  
Mr. B. D. Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Raj Kumar Mehta, AOR  
Mr. Haresh Raichura, AOR  
Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR  
M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR  
Mr. Ajit Pudussery, AOR  
Mr. Pradeep Misra, AOR  
Ms. S. Janani, AOR  
Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR  
Mr. Kanhaiya Priyadarshi, AOR  
Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR  
Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR  
Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR  
Mr. Prashant Kumar, AOR

Mr. Rajesh Srivastava, AOR  
Mr. Gaurav Verma, Adv.  
Mr. Neeraj Dutt Gaur, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjay Singh, Adv.

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR  
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR  
Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Akshay Shrivastava, Adv.  
Mrs. Bihu Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Pratishtha Vij, Adv.

Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR  
Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.  
Mr. K V Girish Chowdary, Adv.  
Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv.  
Mr. T Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.  
Ms. Niti Richhariya, Adv.

Mr. Gagan Gupta, Adv.

Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR  
Mr. G. N. Reddy, AOR  
Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Smarhar Singh, AOR  
Ms. Shweta Kumari, Adv.  
Mr. Jai Krishna Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Kushal Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Mohd. Asim, Adv.  
Mr. Manoj Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Tyagi, AOR

Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.  
Mr. Simanta Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Jainendra Ojha, Adv.

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Arpit Parkash, Adv.  
Mr. D. K. Devesh, AOR

Mr. Sandeep Sudhakar Deshmukh, AOR  
Mr. Nishant Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Tushar D.bhelkar, Adv.

Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR

Mr. Mahesh Thakur, AOR  
Mr. Maibam Nabaghanashyam Singh,, Adv.

Ms. Radhika Gautam, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Khanna, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Sachin Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Kumar Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Hardeep S Sodhi, Adv.  
Mr. Uday Kapur, Adv.  
Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR

Mr. Adarsh Upadhyay, AOR  
Mr. Satish Pandey, AOR

Mr. B H Marlapalle, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Dilip Annasaheb Taur, AOR  
Mr. Amol Vishwasrao Deshmukh, Adv.

Mr. K.M. Nataraj, A.S.G.  
Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR  
Mr. Wasim Qadri, Adv.  
Mr. T.A.khan, Adv.  
Mr. Nalin Kohli, Adv.  
Mr. B.k.satija, Adv.  
Mr. Sharath Nambiar, Adv.  
Dr. N. Visakamurthy, Adv.  
Mr. Neeraj Kr Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Vatsal Joshi, Adv.  
Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.  
Ms. Priyanka Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Prahil Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Harender Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Ambuj Saraswat, Adv.

Ms. Preetika Dwivedi, AOR  
Mr. Braj Kishore Mishra, AOR

Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR  
Mr. Prannoy Joe Sebastian, Adv.

Mr. Shailesh Madiyal, AOR  
Mr. Vaibhav Sabharwal, Adv.  
Mr. Akshay Kumar, Adv.

Mr. K M Natraj, A.S.G.  
Mr. Wasim Qadri, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR  
Mr. R R Rajesh, Adv.  
Mr. Sharath Nambiar, Adv.  
Mr. T A Khan, Adv.  
Mr. B K Satija, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav Aor, Adv.

Mr. Tapesk Kumar Singh, A.A.G.  
Mr. Kumar Anurag Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Anando Mukherjee, AOR  
Mr. Shwetank Singh, Adv.

Mrs. D. Bharathi Reddy, AOR

Mr. Maibam Nabaghanashyam Singh, AOR  
Mr. Shakti K Pattanaik, Adv.

Mr. Jaideep Gupta, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Kunal Chatterji, AOR  
Ms. Maitrayee Banerjee, Adv.  
Mr. Rohit Bansal, Adv.  
Ms. Kshitij Singh, Adv.

Mr. Himanshu Chakravarty, Adv.  
Mr. Devvrat Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Siddharth Sangal, AOR  
Ms. Nilanjani Tandon, Adv.  
Mr. Chirag Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Lalit Allawadhi, Adv.  
Ms. Richa Mishra, Adv.

Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR  
Ms. Aswathi M.k., AOR

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR  
Mr. Manendra Pal Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Kavita Jha, AOR

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv.

Mr. T. V. Ratnam, AOR

Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, AOR  
Mrs. Anu K Joy, Adv.  
Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.

Mr. Bijo Mathew Joy , AOR

Mr. Anandh Kannan N., AOR

Mr. Sahil Tagotra, AOR  
Ms. Abhivyakti Banerjee, Adv.  
Ms. Sakshi Garg, Adv.

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR  
Mr. T.k. Nayak, Adv.



Mr. K.v. Kharlyngdoh, Adv.  
Mr. Daniel Lyngdoh, Adv.

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, Adv.  
Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. P.S. Negi, Adv.

Mrs. Pragya Baghel, AOR  
Mr. Vinod Sharma, AOR

Mr. Tapesk Kumar Singh, A.A.G.  
Mr. Anando Mukherjee, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.

Ms. Taruna Ardhendumauli Prasad, AOR

Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR  
Mr. Mayank Dahiya, Adv.  
Ms. Sugandh Rathor, Adv.  
Ms. Bhupinder, Adv.  
Mr. Sudhir, Adv.

Mr. Ardhendumauli Kumar Prasad, AOR

Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR  
Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.  
Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.

Dr. Joseph Aristotle S., AOR

Mr. Shridhar Y Chitale, Adv.  
Mr. Pranay Chitale, Adv.  
Ms. Sujata Kurdukar, AOR

Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR  
Mr. Sai Shashank, Adv.  
Mr. Deepayan Dutta, Adv.

Mr. Sanjai Kumar Pathak, AOR  
Mr. Arvind Kumar Tripathi, Adv.  
Mrs. Shashi Pathak, Adv.

Mr. Purushottam Sharma Tripathi, AOR  
Ms. Vani Vyas, Adv.  
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Tripathi, Adv.

Mr. Shashank Singh, AOR

Mr. Som Raj Choudhury, AOR  
Ms. Shrutee Aradhna, Adv.

Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.  
Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Ms. Ranjeeta Rohatgi, AOR  
Mr. Satyajeet Kumar, AOR

Mr. Saurabh Mishra, A.A.G.  
Ms. Ankita Choudhary, D.A.G.  
Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR  
Ms. A. Deepa, Adv.

Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.  
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.  
Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.

M/S. Plr Chambers And Co., AOR

Mr. Malak Manish Bhatt, AOR  
Ms. Samridhi, Adv.

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR  
Ms. Uma Bhuvanewari.c, Adv.  
Mr. Abbas, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

I.A. NO.23985/2023 (ITEM NO.4)

1. When this I.A. was called out, none appeared for the High Court of Delhi.
2. Though the matter concerns a very important issue and that certain directions with regard to Delhi High Court were issued on the last date of hearing, the Delhi High Court is not being represented. We do not appreciate the attitude of the Delhi High Court neglecting such an important matter.
3. The Registrar (Judicial) of this Court is directed forthwith

to inform the Registrar General of the High Court of Delhi to remain present in this Court at 12.05 P.M., and the matter was passed over till 12.05 P.M.

4. When the matter is taken at 12.05 P.M., the Registrar General of the Delhi High Court as well as Smt. Kavita Jha, learned counsel are present in the Court. The Registrar General of the Delhi High Court tenders an unconditional apology for not being represented. Smt. Kavita Jha submits that since she was in an overnight part-heard and pro-bono matter, she could not remain present when the matter was called out.

5. In view of the above, we do not propose to take any further action in the matter. However, the Registry of the High Court of Delhi as also the lawyers representing it, should ensure that they are duly represented when their matters are listed before this Court.

6. The following three prayers are sought through this application:-

"i. To High Courts to fill vacancies from service judges or the bench up to 50% of their total strength of judges if a vacancy from the Bar Quota has been lying vacant for more than 6 months.

ii. To issue appropriate directions to the High Courts to fill the vacancies from the Judicial Service Quota as expeditiously as possible: and

iii. To clarify and ensure that the ratio of quota of judges from the Service Judges/Bench remain the

same in any given High Court at least to 1/3rd of the total vacancies in that High Court, irrespective of transfer to or from such a High Court."

7. Insofar as the first prayer i.e. a direction to fill up 50% of the seats in the High Court from the service quota is concerned, we are afraid, as to whether such a direction can be issued on judicial side.

8. We, therefore, are not inclined to consider the said prayer, leaving it open to the applicants to pursue the remedies before such forum as is permissible in law.

9. Insofar as prayer Nos.(ii) and (iii) are concerned, we find the requests to be reasonable, inasmuch as there is already a requirement to fill in 1/3rd of the total vacancies in a particular High Court from the cadre of District & Sessions Judges.

10. We would expect the High Courts to strictly maintain that ratio.

11. It is further to be noted that the tenure of the Service Judges in the High Court, most of the times, is only few years. Taking into consideration that aspect of the matter, we would request all the High Courts to take immediate steps in recommending the names for elevation from the service cadre prior to the occurrence of such vacancies, so that there is no delay in elevation of the Judges from the service cadre.

12. With the above observations and directions, the application is

disposed of.

I.A. NOS.121642/2018, 5933/2023 IN I.A. NOS.121642/2018  
I.A. NO.162247 & 162248/2018 &  
I.A. Nos.162199 and 162201 of 2018 (ITEM NOS.1, 2 & 3)

Since the order passed by this Court stands complied with, these applications are disposed of.

I.A. NOS.201893/2022, 93974/2019 & 72900/2021, 73015/2021,  
40695/2021 & 50269/2022 (ITEM NOS.5, 6 & 7)

1. We find that seven important issues arise for consideration, which are :-

(i) As to whether the 10% quota reserved for Limited Departmental Competitive Examination (for short, 'LDCE') for promotion to Higher Judicial Service i.e. cadre of District Judge, needs to be restored to 25% as determined by this Court in the case of All India Judges' Association and others v. Union of India and others, reported in (2002) 4 SCC 247?

(ii) As to whether the minimum qualifying experience for appearing in the aforesaid examination needs to be reduced, and if so, by how many years?

(iii) As to whether a quota needs to be reserved for meritorious candidate from the Civil Judge (Junior Division) to Civil Judge (Senior Division) so that there is an incentive for merit in the cadre of Civil Judge (Junior Division)?

(iv) If yes, then what should be the percentage thereof

and what should be the minimum experience as a Civil Judge (Junior Division)?

(v) AS to whether the quota to be reserved for the aforementioned departmental examinations in a particular year should be calculated on the cadre strength or on the number of vacancies occurring in the particular recruitment year?

(vi) As to whether some suitability test should also be introduced while promoting the Civil Judge (Senior Division) to the Cadre of District Judges against the existing 65% quota for promotion to Higher Judicial Services on the basis of merit-cum-seniority.

(vii) As to whether the requirement of having minimum three years practice for appearing in the examination of Civil Judge (Junior Division), which was done away by this Court in the case of All India Judges Association & Ors. (supra), needs to be restored? And if so, by how many years?

2. We request the learned Amicus Curiae and the learned counsel appearing on behalf of the State Governments, High Courts and the Union of India, to ponder over these issues and make their submission on the next date of hearing, so that a comprehensive order could be passed with regard to these issues.

3. List on 18.05.2023 at 2.00 p.m., as part heard.

I.A. NOS.44673 and 44677 of 2020 (S. NO.8)

1. Issues raised in the present applications could be considered by the jurisdictional High Court, at the first instance.
2. Learned counsel appearing for the applicants seeks permission to withdraw these applications with liberty to raise the issues before the jurisdictional High Court.
3. Permission is granted.
4. These applications are, accordingly, dismissed as withdrawn with the liberty sought for.

**I.A. NOS.77008 and 77010 OF 2020 (S. NO.9.)**

1. The applicant-in-person is not present when the matter was called.
2. The application is, therefore, dismissed for want of prosecution.

**I.A. NOS.91089 & 91093 OF 2022 (S.NO.10)**

1. The issues raised in the present applications are also raised by the applicant(s), by way of filing Civil Writ Petition No.16540/2014, before the High Court of Punjab & Haryana.
2. As such, the petitioner(s) can very well pursue the aforesaid writ petition.
3. We request the High Court to decide the said petition expeditiously, if the petitioner(s) makes an application in this regard.
4. With the aforesaid observations, the application is disposed of.

**(NARENDRA PRASAD)  
ASTT. REGISTRAR-cum-PS**

**(ANJU KAPOOR)  
COURT MASTER (NSH)**