

ITEM NO.21

COURT NO.9

SECTION III

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No(s). 5988/2019

ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD OF INDIA

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

PEOPLE FOR ELIMINATION OF STRAY TROUBLES. & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(IA No. 74085/2018 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS
IA No. 89077/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS
IA No. 77765/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION
IA No. 22823/2022 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION
IA No. 10871/2018 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 10860/2018 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

WITH

C.A. No. 5990/2019 (III)

C.A. No. 5991/2019 (III)

C.A. No. 5992/2019 (III)

(FOR [PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES] ON IA 2/2015
FOR ON IA 3/2016
IA No. 2/2015 - PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES)

C.A. No. 6042/2019 (III)

(FOR CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING ON IA 1/2010
IA No. 1/2010 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)

C.A. No. 6551/2019 (IV-A)

(FOR VACATING STAY ON IA 108994/2019
IA No. 108994/2019 - VACATING STAY)

C.A. No. 6552/2019 (IV-A)

(and IA No.100795/2017-VACATING STAY and Statement of Objections
filed on behalf of Respondent no. 3.
IA No. 100795/2017 - VACATING STAY)

C.A. No. 6553/2019 (IV-A)

(FOR VACATING STAY ON IA 108987/2019
FOR CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION ON IA 697/2021
FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT ON IA 700/2021
IA No. 697/2021 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION
IA No. 700/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT)

IA No. 108987/2019 - VACATING STAY)

C.A. No. 5930/2019 (XIV-A)

W.P.(C) No. 599/2015 (PIL-W)

(FOR PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON ON IA 1/2015

FOR ON IA 2/2015

FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. ON IA 3/2015

FOR ON IA 4/2015

FOR PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON ON IA 6/2016

FOR [PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES] ON IA 8/2016

FOR [PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES] ON IA 9/2016

FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. ON IA 10/2016

FOR [PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES] ON IA 11/2016

FOR ON IA 12/2016

FOR ON IA 13/2016

FOR ON IA 14/2016

IA No. 10/2016 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.

IA No. 3/2015 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.

IA No. 1/2015 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON

IA No. 6/2016 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON

IA No. 11/2016 - PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES

IA No. 9/2016 - PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES

IA No. 8/2016 - PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES)

C.A. No. 5972/2019 (XI-A)

(MR. V. K. BIJU, ADVOCATE IMPLEADING AS A PARTY RESPONDENT. and IA No.99975/2017-PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION

IA No. 29261/2017 - IMPLEADMENT

IA No. 2/2016 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON

IA No. 99975/2017 - PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION)

W.P.(C) No. 805/2015 (PIL-W)

(FOR PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON ON IA 1/2015

FOR ON IA 2/2015

FOR ON IA 3/2017

FOR ON IA 4/2017

FOR ON IA 5/2017

FOR ON IA 6/2017

FOR AMENDMENT OF THE PETITION ON IA 7/2017

FOR ON IA 8/2017

FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. ON IA 9/2017

FOR INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT [Application for impleadment as party respondent] ON IA 47777/2017 and IA No.80873/2017-DELETING THE NAME OF RESPONDENT

IA No. 7/2017 - AMENDMENT IN CAUSE TITLE

IA No. 9/2017 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.

IA No. 47777/2017 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT

IA No. 1/2015 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON)

C.A. No. 5947/2019 (XI-A)

(FOR PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON ON IA 187131/2019

IA No. 187131/2019 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON)

C.A. No. 5950/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5949/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5956/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5951/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5952/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5953/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5955/2019 (XI-A)

(FOR PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON ON IA 187109/2019
IA No. 187109/2019 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON)

C.A. No. 5948/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5954/2019 (XI-A)

W.P.(C) No. 319/2020 (PIL-W)

(IA No. 24146/2020 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL
DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)

W.P.(C) No. 1439/2019 (PIL-W)

(FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. ON IA 188586/2019
FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. ON IA 119635/2020
IA No. 119635/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.
IA No. 188586/2019 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

SLP(C) No. 2677/2022 (IX)

IA No. 108497/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)

C.A. No. 5989/2019 (III)

(FOR ON IA 52426/2017)

W.P.(C) No. 808/2015 (PIL-W)

(FOR DISPENSING WITH SERVICE OF NOTICE ON IA 2/2015
FOR ON IA 3/2016

IA No. 2/2015 - DISPENSING WITH SERVICE OF NOTICE)

Date : 12-10-2022 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJIV KHANNA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.K. MAHESHWARI

For Parties

Mr. Siddharath Luthra, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Manisha T. Karia, AOR
Mr. Sukhda Kalra, Adv.
Ms. Nidhi Nagpal, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Kumar, Adv.
Petitioner-in-person
Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR
Mr. Abdulla Naseeh V.T., Adv.
Ms. Meena K. Poullose, Adv.

Mr. Amol Chitale, Adv.
Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR
Mr. Subhojit Saha, Adv.
Ms. Ruchira Chatterjee, Adv.

Mr. Manoj V. George, Adv.
Ms. Shilpa Liza George, Adv.
Mr. K.M. Vignesh Ram, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Ashiwan Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Vaidhruti Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Kamendra Mishra, AOR

Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR
Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR
Mr. Sudhanshu S. Choudhari, AOR

Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR
Mr. Rajesh Kandari, Adv.

Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR
Ms. Ria Sachthey, Adv.
Mr. Chetanya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amlendu Kumar Akhilesh Kumar Jha, Adv.
Dr. Ranjeet Bharti, Adv.
Ms. Rubeena Jawed, Adv.

Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR

Mr. Hardeep Singh Anand, AOR

Mr. R. Balasubramanian, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Amol Chitale, Adv.
Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, Adv.
Mr. Ankur S. Kulkarni, Adv.
Mr. Susheel Joseph Cyriac, Adv.
Ms. Sonia Dube, Adv.
Ms. Uditha Chakravarthy, Adv.
M/S. Lex Regis Law Offices, AOR
Ms. Liz Mathew, AOR

Ms. Anushree Prashit Kapadia, AOR

**Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Simanta Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Rajiv Kumar Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Varun Singh, Adv.
Mr. Ashish Kumar Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Nishant Verma, Adv.
Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR**

**Mr. Roy Abraham, Adv.
Ms. Reena Roy, Adv.
Mr. Akhil Abraham, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, AOR**

**Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR
Mr. Kunal Chatterji, AOR
Mr. Ramesh Babu M. R., AOR
Mr. Shree Pal Singh, AOR
Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR
Ms. Uma Devi. M, AOR
Mr. Dinesh Kumar Garg, AOR
Mr. Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR
Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR**

**Mr. Pervical Billimoria, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Jasmine Damkewala, AOR
Mr. Sourabh Malhotra, Adv.
Ms. Ravita Sood, Adv.
Ms. Vaishali Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Siddhartha K. Garg, Adv.
Ms. Nishtha Tyagi, Adv.
Ms. Lovely Garg, Adv.**

**Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR
Ms. G. Indira, AOR
M/S. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR**

**Mr. Ajit Bhasme, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Pandey, Adv.**

**Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR
Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR
Mr. Ratnesh Kumar Shukla, AOR
Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR**

**Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR
Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.**

Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.
Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.

Mrs. D. Geetha, Adv.
Ms. Aswathi M.k., AOR
Ms. Namrata Pulse, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR
Mr. Shantwanu Singh, Adv.
Ms. Pragya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Akshay singh, Adv.

Mr. Chander Uday Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.
Mr. Akhil Abraham Roy, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Valsan, Adv.
M/S. K J John And Co, AOR

Mr. B. Balaji, AOR
Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR
Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR
Mr. Mohd. Apzal, Adv.

Mr. K.M.Nataraj, ASG
Mr. Vatsal Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Vinayak Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Indira Bhakar, Adv.
Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. Rahul Chitnis, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR
Mr. Bharat Bhagla, Adv.

Mr. Atul Yeshwant Chitale, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Tanvi Kakar, Adv.
Mrs. Suchitra Atul Chitale, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR
Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR
Mr. E. C. Vidya Sagar, AOR
Mr. Abhilash MR- Advocate
Mr. Sayooj Mohandas. M Adv.

Mr. Abhilash M.R., Adv.
Mr. Sayooj Mohandas, Adv.

Mr. Vishal Arun, AOR.
Mr. Jyoti Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amarnath Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Jayant Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Abhinav Kumar Srivastava, Adv.

Ilam Paridi, Adv.
Mr. T.S. Sundaram, Adv.
Mr. Vishnu Kumar, Av.
Mr. Aayush Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Arvind Gupta, AOR

Mr. Vishal Arun, AOR

Mr. Varinder Kumar Sharma, AOR
Mr. Sureshan P., AOR
Mr. Samir Ali Khan, AOR
Ms. Manisha T. Karia, AOR

Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR
Mr. Prannoy Joe Sebastian, Adv.

Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR
Mr. Sourav Roy, AOR

Mr. Suhas Kadam, Adv.
M/S. Black & White Solicitors, AOR

Mr. Satyam Thareja, AOR
Mr. Ajay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Lakshmeesh S. Kamath, AOR
Ms. Samriti Ahuja , Adv.

Respondent-in-person

Mr. Harsh Parashar, AOR

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Anupam Ngangom, Adv.
Mr. Wahengbam Immanuel Meitei, Adv.

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR
Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.
Mr. T.K. Nayule, Adv.

Mr. T. K. Nayak, Adv.

Mr. Marbiang Khongwir, Adv.

Mr. Som Raj Choudhury, AOR
Ms. Shrutee Aradhana, Adv.

Mr. D.Kumanan, AOR
Ms. Racheeta Chawla, Adv.
Ms. Divya Singh, Adv.

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR
Mr. Abbas B.

Mr. Vinod Ghai, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR
Ms. Kanika Ahuja, Adv.
Ms. Kirti Ahuja, Adv.
Mr. Mayank Dahiya, Adv.
Ms. Priyanka C., Adv.

Mr. S.. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR
Ms. Sweena Nair, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR
Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR

Mr. Ajay Singh, Adv.
Mr. Ram Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Vivek Narayan Sharma, AOR
Mr. Nikhil Jaiswal, Adv.

Mr. Pai Amit, AOR

Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR
Ms. Eliza Bar, Adv.

Mr. K.M. Natraj, ASG
Mr. R.R. Rajesh, Adv.
Mr. Sharad Singh, Adv.
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR
Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. S.K. Singhanian, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Kr. Verma, Adv.
Mr. T.S. Sabarish, Adv.

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Mr. Juais. P, Adv.
Mr. Prsanth K., Adv.
M/S. Lead Counsel, AOR

Ms. Manali Singhal, Adv.

Mr. Santosh Sachin, AOR
Ms. Aanchal Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Deepak Singh Rawat, Adv.

Mr. Vivek Sibal, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Supriya Juneja, AOR
Ms. A. Sahitya Veena, Adv.
Ms. Esha Dutta, Adv.

Mr. P.V. Dinesh, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Raj Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Ashwini Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Bineesh K, Yadav, Adv.
Ms. Anne Mathew, AOR

Mr. Ankit Goel, AOR

Ms. Pavani Mahalaxmi, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Swati Jindal, AOR
Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.
Ms. Arushi Kulshrestha, Adv.

Dr. L.S. Chaudhary, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Chaudhar, Adv.
Mr. D.S. Chauhary, Adv.
Mr. Parambir Singh, Adv.
Mr. Viresh Choudhary, Adv.
Mr. Vishesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Dinesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Ashwani Kumar Dubey, AOR

Mr. Sudhanshu Prakash, Adv.
Mr. Shailesh Madiyal, Adv.
Ms. Vipasha Singh , AOR

Mr. B. Karuna Karan, Adv.
Dr. K. Kannan, Adv.
Mr. K. Balambinai, Adv.
Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR

Mr. Romy Chacko, AOR
Mr. Gopal Prasad, AOR

Mr. P. V. Surendranath, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Subhash Chandran K.R., Adv.
Mr. Krishna L.R., Adv.
Mr. Sawan Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Biju P Raman, AOR

Mr. M. Gireesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Ankur S. Kulkarni, AOR
Ms. Pushpita Basak, Adv.

Mr. Anand Grover, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR
Mr. Ravinder Singh, Adv.
Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.
Ms. Raveesha Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Varnika Singh, Adv.
Ms. Deeksha Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.
Ms. Deeksha Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. V. Chitambaresh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Karthik S.D., Adv.
Mr. C. Govind Venugopal, Adv.
Mr. John Mathew, AOR

Mr. Krishnan Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Debmalya Banerjee, Adv.
Mr. Kartik Bhatnagar, Adv.
Mr. Rohan Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Anmol, Adv.
Mr. Nicholas Choudhary, Adv.
Mr. Shreesh Chadha, Adv.
Ms. Esha Dutta, Adv.
M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR
Mr. Munawwar Naseem, AOR
Ms. Sanjna Dua, Adv.

Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR
Mr. M.S. Vishnu Sankar, Adv.
Mr. Ravi, Adv.

Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR
Mr. S. C. Birla, AOR
Mr. Vishnu Sharma, AOR

Ms. Charu Sangwan, AOR
Mr. Krishna Raj, Adv.

Mr. Mohan V. Katarki, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Subhashchandra Sagar, Adv.
Mr. Vinayak Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Hemant Kumar Sagar, Adv.
Mr. E.C. Vidyasagar, AOR

Nanita Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Vivek Sharma, Adv.
Mr. FaEEK Ulfarooq, Adv.
Mr. Sachin Pahwa, Adv.

Ms. Pooja Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Amitesh Chandra Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Pratibha Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Yadav, Adv.

Ms. Ankita Wadhwa, Adv.

Ms. Lakshya Ruhalla, Adv.

Ms. Radhika Chaturvedi, Adv.

Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv

Ms. Niharika Dwivedi, Adv.

Ms. Shweta Sand, Adv.

Mr. Narendra Pal Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Bahl, Adv.

Mr. Rishabh Raj, Adv.

Mr. Rishi Kumar Singh Gautam, Adv.

Mr. P. Venkat Reddy, Adv.

Mr. Prashant Kr. Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Mahfooz A. Nazki, AOR

Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.

Mr. Shaik Mohammad Haneef, Adv.

Mr. T. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.

Mr. K.V. Girish Chowdary, Adv.

Ms. Rajeshwari Mukherjee, Adv.

Ms. Niti Richariya, Adv.

Ms. Anjali Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Shagun Matia, AOR

Dr. Joseph Aristotle S, AOR

Ms. Nupur sharma, Adv.

Mr. Shobhit Dwivedi, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Kumar Mahara, Adv.

Ms. Vaidehi Rastogi, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

Applications for permission to appear and argue in-person are allowed.

Applications for intervention/impleadment are allowed with the observation that the parties would be allowed to

address arguments.

In our opinion, the order of this Court dated 18.11.2015 viz. the penultimate paragraph requires a clarification. We do not think it is the intent of the said paragraph is that all writ petitions and proceedings before the High Courts would be stayed and no effective and required orders will be passed by the High Courts in cases pertaining to the stray dogs. The proceedings before the High Court have not been transferred to this court. We perceive and believe that there are and would be individual cases that raise grievance relating to the applicability and enforcement of Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 and The Animal Birth Control (Dogs) Rules, 2001 as well as the State Laws which may require urgent hearing and decisions would depend upon relevant prevailing facts in an area or location. Parties should not be compelled to approach this Court at Delhi, when the issues raised can be considered by the High Courts. Accordingly, in order to avoid any ambiguity and doubt, we clarify that the order dated 18.11.2015 does not bar or prohibit the authorities/ individuals including associations and organizations from approaching the jurisdictional High Courts for appropriate relief. The High Courts, will examine and deciding these cases in accordance with law, and will keep in mind the orders passed by this Court and the precedents. If there is

any violation of law, the parties are at liberty and should approach the jurisdictional High Court.

The High Court of Judicature at Bombay can hear and decide WP No. 9513/2021 in accordance with law. Similarly, the contempt petitions stated to pending before the High Court would be considered and decided in accordance with law. It is clarified that we have not expressed any opinion on merits including the contentions and pleas raised by the parties.

In view of the aforesaid, learned senior advocate appearing on behalf of the petitioner(s) in SLP(C) No. 2677/2022 states that nothing survives in the matter and accordingly, the petition is disposed of. Pending application thereto shall also stand disposed of.

Pendency of the present petitions/appeals would not come in the way of the High Court of Kerala deciding, In Re: Bruno matter [WP(C) No. 13204/2021]. It goes without saying that the orders/judgments passed by this Court as well as the law of precedents would be given due consideration.

Any party aggrieved by the orders passed by the High Court would be at liberty to file a special leave petition before this Court.

The Animal Welfare Board of India will file an affidavit enclosing therewith data/statistics with regard to dog bites during the last seven years in different States and prominent cities of the States. The affidavit would also

state the steps taken by them on different aspects/issues raised by the parties, and whether the local authorities have complied with and implemented the orders dated 18.11.2015 and 09.03.2016.

The Board shall indicate whether they would like this Court to directions to the States or local authorities with regard to enforcement of Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 and the applicable rules.

Liberty is also granted to the parties to give their suggestions.

Parties may file objections to Justice Siri Jagan Committee Report. Copy of the objections will be furnished to the contesting party, who may file their response.

Parties are also given liberty to file compilation of the relevant pleadings and documents.

List all these cases on a non-miscellaneous day in the month of February, 2023.

(SONIA BHASIN)
COURT MASTER (SH)

(DIPTI KHURANA)
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR