ITEM NO.38 Court 5 (Video Conferencing)

**SECTION II-B** 

## SUPREME COURT OF INDIA RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Criminal Appeal No(s). 135/2010

**BUDHADEV KARMASKAR** 

Appellant(s)

**VERSUS** 

THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(Mr. Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv. (A.C.) and Mr. Pijush K. Roy, Advocate/(A.C.)/Appellant may be shown as Amicus curiae)

ONLY I.A NO. 80140/2020 APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS TO BE LISTED )

Date: 28-02-2022 This matter was called on for hearing today.

CORAM:

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE L. NAGESWARA RAO

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B.R. GAVAI

For the parties :

Amicus Curiae Mr. Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv

Mr. Ketan Paul, Adv Mr. Tushar Bhushan, Adv Mr. Amartya Bhushan, Adv

Amicus Curiae Mr. Pijush K. Roy, Adv

Ms. Kakali Roy, Adv

Mr. Abhishek Kaushik, Adv

Applicant(s)/DMSC Mr Anand Grover, Sr Adv

Ms Tripti Tandon, Adv Ms Savita Singh, AOR Mr Ashok Kumar Singh, Adv

Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR

HC of Karnataka Mr. K.M.Nataraj, ASG

Mr. Raghavendra S. Srivasta, Adv. Mr. Venkitasubramoniam T.R., Adv.

Mr. Likhi Chand Bonsle, Adv.

Ms. Komal Mundhra, Adv.

Mr. Jayant K.Sud, ASG

Mohd. Akhil, Adv

Mr. Sanjay Kr.Tyagi, Adv

Mr. Sunita Sharma, Adv

Mr. O.P.Shukla, Adv

Mr. Adit Khorana, Adv.

Mr. B.K. Satija, Adv.

Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv.

Mr. Digvijay Dam, Adv.

Ms. Shakshi Kakkar, Adv.

Mr. G.S. Makker, AOR

Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, AOR

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR

**UIDAI** 

Mr. Zoheb Hossain, Adv.

Mr. Karthik Tayur, Adv

**UT** of Lakshyadeep

Mr. Jayant K. Sud, ASG

Ms. Priyadarshni Priya, Adv.

Mr. Apoorva Kurup, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Ranjan, Adv.

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

UT of Dadra & Nagar

Haveli, Daman & Diu Mr. Jayant K. Sud, ASG

Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv.

Ms. Sanskriti Pathak, AOR

Mr. Anil Hooda, Adv.

Ms. Saswat Parihar, Adv.

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Jayant K. Sud, Ld. ASG

Mr. Anil Hooda Adv.

Mr. Shashawat Parihar Adv.

Mr Harish Pandey Adv.

Ms. Sanskriti Pathak Adv.

Mr. Jitender Hooda Adv.

Mr. Shafik Ahmed Adv.

Mr. Aditya Kaushik Adv.

Mr. Mukesh Kumar Adv.

Mr. Tarun Mohan, Adv.

Mr. D. S. Mehra AOR

Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR

Mr. Anil K. Jha, AOR

Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR

Ms. A. Subhashini, AOR

Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR

State of W.B.

Mr. Raghent Basant, Adv.

Mr. Suhaan Mukerji, Adv

Mr. Nikhil Parikshith, Adv

Mr. Vishal Prasad, Adv

Mr. Abhishek Manchanda, Adv

Mr. Sayandeep Pahari, Adv.

Mr. Tanmay Sinha, Adv

M/S. Plr Chambers And Co., AOR

Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR

Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. M. T. George, AOR

Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR

Mrs. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, AOR

Mr. Jogy Scaria, AOR

State of Assam

Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR

Mr. Ankit Agarwal, Adv.

Ms. Ragini Pandey, Adv.

State of Punjab

Ms. Jaspreet Gogia, AOR

Ms. Mandakini Singh, Adv

Mr. Karanvir Gogia, Adv.

Ms. Shivangi Singhal, Adv

Ms. Ashima Mandla, Adv

St of Uttarakhand

Mr. Saurabh Trivedi, AOR

Mr. Ashutosh Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Tanmaya Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR

Mr. Yogesh Kanna, AOR.

M/S.Corporate Law Group, AOR

Dr. Joseph Aristotle S., AoR.

Mr. V. G. Pragasam, AOR

Mr. Anuvrat Sharma, AOR

Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Ms. G. Indira, AOR

UT of Puducherry Mr. Aravindh.S., AOR

Mr. C.Rubavathi, Adv

St. of Nagaland Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv,

Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv

GNCTD Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR

State of W.B. Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv

Mr. Umang Tripathi, Adv. Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR

State of Rajasthan Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr.Adv.

Mr. Arpit Prakash, Adv. Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR

State of Telengana Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR

Ms. Sweena Nair, Adv. Mr. P. Mohith Rao, Adv

Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR

Mr. Rohit Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Ms. Niranjana Singh, AOR

State of Bihar Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mrs. Bihu Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Pratishtha Vij, Adv.

Mr. Akshay C. Shrivastava, Adv.

Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR

Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, AOR

Mr. P. V. Dinesh, AOR

Ms. Aswathi M.K., AOR

State of Karnataka Mr. Shubhanshu Padhi, Adv.

Mr. Ashish Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Rakshit Jain, Adv

Mr. Vishal Banshal, Adv

State of Kerala Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR

Mr. Abdullah Naseeh, Adv

Ms. Meena K.P, Adv

State of Gujarat Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.

Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

State of Manipur Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv

Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Tanmaya Agarwal, AOR

Mr. Wrick Chatterjee, Adv

Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Ashish Ranjan, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR

M/S. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR

Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

Mr. Garvesh Kabra, AOR

Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR

Ms. Liz Mathew, AOR

Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR

State of Mizoram Mr. Siddhesh Kotwal, Adv.

Ms. Ana Upadhyay, Adv.

Ms.Manya Hasija, Adv

Mr. Akash Singh, Adv

Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR

State of H.P. Mr. Vikas Mahajan, Sr. Adv./AAG

Mr. Vidit Anand, Adv.

Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Arun Singh, Adv.

Mr. Vinod Sharma, AOR.

Mr. Parijat Som, Adv.

## State of Sikkim

Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Verma, Adv

Mr. Rajiv Kumar Sinha, Adv

Mr. Simanta Kumar, Adv

Mr. Sunil Saraogi, Adv.

Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR

#### U.T. of J&K

Ms. Taruna Ardhendumauli Prasad, AOR

Ms. Deepika Gupta, Adv

Mr. Satish Pandey, AOR

## State of Tripura

Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR.

Mr. Kabir Shankar Bose, Adv.

MR. ISHAAN BORTHAKUR, ADV.

## State Of Meghalaya

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR,

Mr. Kynpham V. Kharlyngdoh, Adv.

Mr. Daniel Lyngdoh, Adv. Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.

# St.of Andhra PradeshMr. Mahfooz A. Nazki, AOR

Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv

Mr. Shaik Mohamad Haneef, Adv

Mr. T. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv

Mr. K.V.Girish Chowdary, Adv

Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv

## State of Haryana

Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR

Mr. Bhanwar Jadon, Adv

Ms. Adira A Nair, Adv

Ms. Babita Mishra, Adv

# **UT** of Chandigarh

Mr. Manpreet S. Doabia, Adv

Mrs. Kiran Bhardwaj, AOR

#### St of Chattisgarh

Mr. S.C. Verma, Sr. Adv./Advocate General

Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR.

Mr. Anvit Seemansh, Adv.

## State of Maharashtra

Mr. Sachin Patil, AOR.

Mr. Rahul Chitnis, Adv.

Mr. Aaditya A. Pande, Adv.

Mr. Geo Joseph, Adv.

Ms. Shwetal Shepal, Adv

St of M.P. Mr. Veer Vikrant Singh, Dy. AG

Mr. Abhinav Shrivastava, Adv

Mr. Sunny Choudhary (AOR)

UT of A&N Islands Mr. Ankur S. Kulkarni, AOR

Mr. Susheel Joseph Cyriac, Adv

Ms. Uditha Chakravarthy, Adv

State of Odisha Dr. Anindita Pujari, AOR

Mr. Siddhartha Srivastava, Adv

Mr. Azad Bansala, Adv

Ms. Prakriti Rastogi, Adv

Ms. Kavita Bharadwaj, Adv

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

On 10.01.2022, we had directed the State Governments/Union Territories to complete process of issuance of ration cards/voter cards to all sex workers within a period of two weeks. Ιt was mentioned in the said order that the basis of identification of sex workers should not be confined to the list that had been prepared by the NACO. State Governments should take into account the list submitted by Community Based Organisations which required to be verified by the concerned District Legal Service Authority/State AIDS Control Society. The competent authorities were directed to issue rations cards after verification of such lists. Barring a few States, the State Governments/Union Territories have submitted their status reports.

## State of West Bengal

Mr. Pijush K. Roy, learned Amicus Curiae, submitted that the direction issued by this Court on 10.01.2022 has not been complied with by the State, as the identification of sex workers has not been done properly. The ration cards, voter ID cards and Aadhar cards have not been issued even to those sex workers who have been identified by the concerned authorities in the State.

Mr. Raghent Basant, learned counsel appearing for the State of West Bengal, submitted that guidelines were issued for issuance of Digital Ration Cards(DRC)/Food Coupons to sex workers and in transgender persons August, 2020. 11.02.2022, 6227 sex workers were identified in the 3784 sex workers have been provided ration State. cards. Such of those sex workers, who do not have ration cards, have been given Khadyasathi Food Coupons. According to the scheme of the State Government, the coupon holders are entitled to 5 of food grains without any payment Kqs. 30.06.2022. Mr. Basant submitted that the process for issuance of ration cards for all sex workers who have been identified will be completed soon.

Looking at the sex workers identified by the other States, we are sceptical about the number of identified sex workers in the State. Though Mr. Basant submitted that the basis for identification is the list submitted by NACO. We direct the concerned authorities in the State Government to take assistance of Community Based Organisations and carry out a fresh exercise of identifying sex workers in the State of West Bengal. The said exercise shall be based on the list submitted by NACO. After collating the information supplied by NACO and the Community Based Organisations, the authorities shall verify those lists and take immediate steps for issuance of ration cards to the sex workers without insisting on proof of identity.

The process as directed above shall be completed within a period of four weeks from today.

## State of Maharashtra

According to the information provided by the State of Maharashtra in December, 2021, NACO has identified 25,594 sex workers and 6,731 dependent children. 11,282 sex workers have been issued ration cards. Mr. Sachin Patil, learned counsel appearing for the State, submitted that dry ration is being supplied to all those sex workers who have been identified. In the Order dated 10.01.2022, we directed the State Governments not to restrict issuance of ration cards only to those sex workers identified by NACO. The State of Maharashtra is

directed to invite the Community Based Organisations to identify and submit a list of sex workers which shall be verified by the competent authorities. The benefit of the orders passed by this Court relating to issuance of ration cards shall be extended to the identified sex workers. Needless to say, the State Government shall continue to provide dry ration to sex workers without insisting on proof of identity.

We have gone through the note that has prepared by Mr. Pijush K. Roy, learned Amicus Curiae, which contains a gist of the status reports filed by the State Governments/Union Territories pursuant to the order passed by this Court UIDAI has suggested to this Court that 10.01.2022. Aadhaar Card could be issued to sex workers without insisting on proof of identity, subject to their producing a certificate issued by a Gazetted Officer of NACO or a Gazetted Officer of Health Department of the respective State Governments/ Union Territory.

Mr. Jayant Bhushan, learned senior counsel and Amicus Curiae and Mr. Anand Grover, learned senior counsel appearing for the applicant-Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC) sought time to obtain instructions about the workability of the said proposition.

Having dealt with the Status reports filed by the States of West Bengal and Maharashtra, we feel that it is not necessary to take up the status reports filed by each State, separately. The scrutiny of the status reports filed by the State Governments would show that directions issued by this Court on 10.01.2022, have been implemented in part.

We direct all the State Governments/Union Territories to continue with the process identification of the sex workers who do not have any proof of identity and who are deprived of distribution of ration. The figures that have been given in the status reports are not realistic. The shall State Governments take support of the Community Based Organisation and not merely rely on lists prepared by NACO for the purpose of implementing the earlier directions issued by this Court. **Apart** from ration cards, the State Governments shall also take steps to issue voter ID cards to the sex workers identified by NACO and Community Based Organisations after verification of the lists.

The State Governments/Union Territories shall continue to distribute dry ration to the sex workers without insisting on their proof of identity. The status reports regarding the implementation of the

directions issued by this Court on 10.01.2022 shall be filed within three weeks from today after submitting a copy of the same to Mr. Jayant Bhushan and Mr. Pijush K. Roy, learned Amicus Curiae, Mr. Anand Grover, learned senior counsel and Mr. Jayant K. Sud, learned Additional Solicitor General.

List on 31.03.2022.

(Geeta Ahuja) Court Master (Anand Prakash)
Court Master