

**SUPREME COURT OF INDIA**

This file relates to the proposal for appointment of following eleven Judicial Officers as Judges of the Rajasthan High Court:

1. Shri Abhay Chaturvedi
2. Shri Devendra Kachhawaha
3. Shri Satish Kumar Sharma
4. Ms. Prabha Sharma
5. Shri Manoj Kumar Vyas
6. Shri Rameshwar Vyas
7. Shri Devendra Joshi
8. Shri Chandra Kumar Songara
9. Shri Anoop Kumar Saxena
10. Shri Narendra Singh Dhaddha
11. Shri Hemant Kumar Jain

The above recommendation made by the Chief Justice of the Rajasthan High Court on 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2018, in consultation with his two senior-most colleagues, has the concurrence of the Chief Minister and the Governor of Rajasthan.

In order to ascertain suitability of the above-named recommendees for elevation to the High Court, we have consulted our colleagues conversant with the affairs of the Rajasthan High Court. Copies of letters of opinion of our consultee-colleagues received in this regard are placed below.

For purpose of assessing merit and suitability of the above-named recommendees for elevation to the High Court, we have carefully scrutinized the material including the observations made by the Department of Justice as well as certain complaints placed in the file. Apart from this, we considered it appropriate to have interaction with all the recommendees. On the basis of interaction and having regard to all relevant factors, the Collegium is of the considered view that S/Shri (1) Abhay Chaturvedi, and (2) Narendra Singh Dhadha, (mentioned at Sl. Nos. 1 and 10 above) are suitable for being appointed as Judges of the Rajasthan High Court.

As regards Shri Chandra Kumar Songara, (mentioned at Sl. No.8 above), consideration of the proposal for his elevation is deferred for the present and would be taken up after additional information is received from the Chief Justice of the Rajasthan High Court.

As regards S/Shri (1) Devendra Kachhawaha, (2) Satish Kumar Sharma, (3) Ms. Prabha Sharma, (4) Manoj Kumar Vyas, (5) Rameshwar Vyas, (6) Devendra Joshi, (7) Shri Anoop Kumar Saxena, and (8) Shri Hemant Kumar Jain (mentioned at Sl. Nos. 2 to 7, 9 and 11 above) consideration of their proposal for elevation is deferred for the present. The same would be taken up upon receipt of detailed information from the Department of Justice in respect of certain unconfirmed inputs pointed out in the file.

We have also taken note of the fact that the above proposal involves non-recommendation of some senior Judicial Officers. In this regard, we have gone through Minutes dated 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2018 of the High Court Collegium, which has duly recorded reasons for not recommending names of these Judicial Officers. We are in agreement with the justification given by the High Court Collegium in its Minutes dated 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2018 for not recommending these senior Judicial Officers.

In view of the above, the Collegium resolves to recommend that S/Shri (1) Abhay Chaturvedi, and (2) Narendra Singh Dhadha, Judicial Officers, be appointed as Judges of the Rajasthan High Court. Their *inter se* seniority be fixed as per the existing practice.

( Ranjan Gogoi ), C.J.I.

( S.A. Bobde), J.

( N.V.Ramana), J.

April 01, 2019.

