# IN THE HIGH COURT OF KARNATAKA AT BENGALURU (ORIGINAL JURISDICTION) WRIT PETITION NO. OF 2019(GM-RES)PIL

#### Between

- 1. Suresh Heblikar,
- 2. Joseph Hoover,
- 3. J Manjunath,

#### And

- Union of India by its Deputy Inspector General
  Of Forest(WL) Ministry of Environment, Forests
  and Climate Change,6<sup>th</sup> Floor,
  VayuWing,IndiraParyavaranBhavan, Jor Bag
  Road,Aliganj
  NEW DELHI-110 003
- Principal Chief Conservator of Forests ,
   AranyaBhavan, Bengaluru-560 003,
- 3 National Highways Authority of India By its Assistant Commissioner, Belagavi And CALA,NH4-A, BELAGAVI-

Respondents

Petitioners

# MEMORANDUM OF WRIT PETITION UNDER ARTICLES 226 AND 227 OF THE CONSTITUTION OF INDIA

The Petitioners in the above matter seeks leave of this Hon'ble Court to file the Petition as Public Interest Litigation. The Petitioners have no personal or vested interest in the matter.

1. Petitioner No.1, Mr. Suresh Heblikar, belongs to Dharwad, a place known for arts, culture, poets and writers. He has nearly twenty years of experience in Films and Environment. He is also a powerful environmental voice in regional T.V channels representing environmental issues. He is a recipient of several awards like the Rajiv Gandhi Environment Award, Citizen Extraordinaire Award, United Nations – OSIRIS F.A.O Award to name a few from Govt of Karnataka, Rotary International and 19th Agro film festival 2002, Nitra, Slovakia.

Petitioner No. 2, Mr. Joseph Hoover, is an independent who had formerly worked in Indian Express, Deccan Herald and Times of India for 24 Years and have been involved in wildlife conservation for over three decades. He is a former member of the Karnataka Wildlife Advisory Board. He has been successful in engaging international cricketers in wildlife conservation, including Sachin Tendulkar, Anil Kumble, RahulDravid amongst many other icons. Instrumental in organising the Wildlife Service Award under the Crickerters for Wildlife Conservation banner.

**Petitioner No. 3**, Mr. ManjunathJ , belong to an agricultural family of Kollegal town in Chamarajanagar District.

a registered society under the registrar of societies, Bengaluru. He had been officially monitoring Wildlife Offences in Chamarajanagar and Mysore District and attending court cases on behalf of the Chief Wildlife Warden as per letter dated 12-1-2004 for 8 years under the Chairmanship of two Chief Wildlife Wardens, Karnataka. He has over 30 years of experience in Elephant corridor restoration and conducting several legal workshops for department of Forest all over and Tamil Nadu.

- 2. It is submitted that there was a report on 22,000 trees being felled for the widening of NH4A in Deccan Herald as of 30<sup>th</sup> Oct 2018. The report highlighted that trees were felled in Khanapura-Londa as DilipBuildconLtd, a Madhya Pradesh-based company has decided to start the work on road widening. This news report alerted concerned citizens of Belgaum and they conducted field visit to ascertain the facts on field. It was seen that modern machinery were used to bring down huge girth sized trees in these sections at a very fast rate.
- There were multiple field visits by concerned citizens to the entire stretch of NH4-A in Nov 2018 and Dec 2018 after local citizens alerted us. The local groups at Belgaum were in the meantime collating more information related to the tree felling.
- 4. The newspaper reports claimed that an overall 22,000 trees were planned to be felled in this stretch. However, when we visited the area, we saw many low girth sized trees being felled without any marking on it. It is also brought to your notice that as many as 1 Lakh trees of varying girth size will eventually be felled considering the very dense forests that belongs to Eco Class I. During our field visit we have seen many trees that were cleared and felled without any accountability. Many of the tree species felled are species that do not perform well in disturbed areas and is impossible to raise with human intervention. When compensatory afforestation is being planned, the rich species diversity that was lost due to this felling is never considered. Compensatory afforestation is implemented by monoculture of timber species in place of the diverse naturally regenerated rich tropical wet evergreen forests!
- 5. As on 14<sup>th</sup> Jan 2019/16<sup>th</sup> Jan 2019, several petitions were submitted to Sri. SANDEEP DAVE, IAS ,Additional Chief Secretary to Government ,Forest, Ecology and Environment Department, Karnataka Govt Secretariat, Bengaluru, Karnataka , ShriVijayakumarGogi, IFS, Principal Secretary to Govt (Forest), Forest, Ecology and Environment Department, Karnataka Govt Secretariat, Bengaluru, Karnataka and Regional Director, Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change, KendriyaSadan, IVth floor, E&F Wings, 17th Main Road, IInd Block, Koramangala, Bengaluru by various individuals and civil society groups to stop any large scale felling of trees on an immediate basis. The copies

of the same are produced herewith as Annexure A, A1 to A5. This representation was given in view of the recent Public Notification issued by the 3<sup>rd</sup> Respondent for Land Acquisition from private land owners in and around various villages of Belgavai and surrounding places vide Notification No. LAQ/NH4-A/CR-1675 dated 13-11-2018 the copy of which is produced herewith as Annexure 'B'.

- 6. It is submitted that conserving the natural heritage of the country can be only achieved by preserving the remaining natural forests with the vast variety of flora and fauna, which represent the remarkable biological diversity and genetic resources of the country" and "Checking soil erosion and denudation in the catchment areas of rivers, lakes, reservoirs in the "interest of soil and water conservation, for mitigating floods and droughts and for the retardation of siltation of reservoirs." An ecosystem that is highly stable over a period of several centuries may be highly fragile in a short-term perspective. Even if there are several proposed meanings of stability and fragility in an ecosystem, they basically relate to the relative changes in species abundances and in species composition. Ecosystem fragility relates to the degree of change in species. In view of the environmental sensitivity and ecological significance of the Western Ghats region and the complex interstate nature of its geography, as well as possible impacts of climate change on this region, it has become inevitable to conserve effectively the ecological fragile lands, minimizing the reduction or degradation of these ecosystems and biological diversity therein, which evolved through years.
- 7. Western Ghats stretch in Karnataka is home to one of the last remaining tropical wet evergreen forests. Western Ghats is a biodiversity hotspot and is a declared world heritage site by UNESCO. The flora in Very dense forest of Eco Class I belong to the rare, endangered and threatened species that are difficult to be raised and planted. Also, CAMPA does not consider any diversity conservation of tree species that are lost due to felling. It is done with timber species as a goal and is eventually executed as a monoculture of timber species elsewhere. Thus, the ecological services lost due to such large-scale felling of diverse very dense forest is never compensated for by the user agency nor by the Forest

department. Most of these species of trees support the food security of large biodiversity including elephants; which the monocultured species fail to address thus increasing human elephant conflicts in the nearby farmlands. Elephants and other ungulates are forced to come out in search of food and water when the forests are depleted of its' original tree cover and diversity. Four Kali Hydel projects there have been similar forest diversions that have resulted in loss of more than 50,000 HA of forests. This has already impacted the ecology of Uttara Kannada and Belagavi in Western Ghats, affecting the rain cycle and subsistence of local communities. A study done by IISc has been reported in Deccan Herald newspaper on 31st Dec 2018 as per Annexure 'C' which has revealed that there has been a decline in evergreen forest cover from 61.8% in 1973 to 37.5% in 2016. During the same time, the dry deciduous forest reduced 7.82% 2.24% from the catchment to in areas.

- 8. It is humbly submitted that as per the letter dated 21-11-2012 by Chief Conservator of Forests, the diversion is for 93.568 Ha of forest land from 0.00 Km to 84.12 Km in Belgaum and Haliyal forest divisions. Out of the 93.568 Ha , 53.744 Ha is proposed to be diverted in Belgaum Division and 39.824 Ha is diverted in Haliyal division. It is submitted that this report mentions about an important elephant corridor where the proposed road passes between Wildlife Sanctuary and forests of Khanapur and Jamboti. This report in point number 7 mentions that " keeping in view the sensitivity of the proposed forest area, consent of the Chief Wildlife Warden and Principle Chief Conservator of Forests (Wildlife) and National Board of Widlife to be obtained for implementing the road widening for NH4A". The Karnataka Forest Department has not been able to produce the consent letter of Chief Wildlife Warden and National Board of Wildlife. It is thus submitted that the entire tree felling done in the stretch of NH4A is hence illegal without the consent of Chief Wildlife Warden, PCCF and NBWL. The letter No A5(3) GFL-CR-104/2011-12 dated 21-11-2012 is hereby submitted as Annexure 'D'.
- 9. It is submitted that while NH4A is from Belgaum to Goa, there is no approval for road widening that passes through Mollem Wildlife Sanctuary and Mahaveer National Park in Goa State. As per the decision taken by the Standing

Committee of the NBWL in its 28th Meeting held on 20th March 2013, the approval of the National Tiger Conservation Authority (in case of Tiger Reserves) and concerned State Boards for Wildlife in case of non-Tiger Reserve for other PAs., must be obtained. The recommendations of the subcommittee is herewith produced as Annexure 'E'. Tree cutting in Karnataka prior to procuring approval for widening in Goa inside two Protected Areas is a hurried effort to conceal the illegality behind the act in Karnataka.

- 10. It is pertinent to note that after the tree felling inside some of the critically eco fragile zones, NHAI has called for private land acquisition notification in Deccan Herald as on 3<sup>rd</sup> Jan 2019. This also proves that there is a hurried effort to clear every single tree inside the forest land without even ensuring that the land acquisition process for the entire length of NH4A is completely by involving all stakeholders.
- 11. The total number of trees cleared is also estimated at a much lower number than the felling executed on the field for the distance mentioned. With the highly efficient machinery available for cutting trees, several thousands are felled without much monitoring on site by department of forests. The WRI satellite image maps clearly states that "Most of the landslides in the Kodagu region happened due to slope failure along the roads as observed in the following WRI India generated maps of the landslide-affected areas.". In the above scenario of unpredictable heavy rains in the region and loss of green cover causing deleterious impacts on the slope stability, it is brought to your notice that the unscientific tree felling of such large scale would mean risking the lives of the local villages to the wrath and impact of large-scale landslide and devastation in the name of connecting urban cities across two states. Road widening in such hilly and steep terrain has proven to cause landslides during heavy monsoon similar to the landslides in Kodagu and Wayanad in Aug 2018. Taking from example of steep slopes on the Western Ghats where slope stability is primarily taken care by the deep root structures of the large trees with buttress roots. It is a proven scientific fact that these older than 100 years grandmother trees in the Western Ghats eco system not just prevent large scale landslides but also provide ecosystem services of water harvesting, diversion and

management with leaf litter falling on the soil surface every year. This leaf litter acts as a primary sponge to regulate the flow of excess water that falls during monsoons. Every inch of leaf litter lost would reduce the water holding capacity of the landscape thus reducing the capacity of the first order streams in these landscapes to flow during periods of no rain. Large-scale tree felling in such eco fragile landscape will mean we are putting the entire population of humans and other species at severe risk during the next heavy rain.

- 12. It is submitted that the area around this region where the trees are being cut down is very important and vital as it brings very heavy rains for Belgaum, Uttar Kannada and Dharwad. Rivers such as Kali, Mahadayi, and Malaprabha originate in this region and is primary to the existence of millions of farmers who are farming for subsistence in this region. It is submitted that many of these regions are already undergoing severe farming crisis with the burden of farm debts. Any change in the water availability from these rivers due to human interference could mean such large-scale developmental projects are depriving the very existence of thousands of farmers dependent on these rivers and landscape for their daily subsistence.
- 13. It is submitted that the recent floods and landslides of Aug 2018 in Kodagu has brought out the critical question of hill slope management while implementing developmental projects. There were two scientific reports supported with detailed satellite images that proved how roads are the primary cause of triggering landslides. The World Research Institute's satellite images of the recent Kodagu landslide and how roads have triggered these landslides as there were overall 765 landslides in Kodagu and Kerala during Aug 2018 as per Annexure 'F'.
- 14. It is hereby submitted that the "Inspection Note of Sri P Sridhar, IFS, Additional Principal Chief Conservator of Forests as of 10<sup>th</sup> Jul 2012 clearly states the critical nature of this landscape from the floral and faunal perspective. The report dated 10<sup>th</sup> July 2012 mentions about the stretch beyond Anmod is of thick evergreen forest where ideal no road expansion should be permitted in such pristine ecosystem. It also highlights how any additional area diversion in the

steeper gradient could have serious ecological ramifications. The Inspection report dated 10<sup>th</sup> Jul 2012 is produced herewith as Annexure 'G'.

- 15. The stretch from 15.75 kms to 29.01 kms is proposed as a 45m wide 4 lane road and from 36.933 kms to 60.710 kms as a 26m wide 2 lane road. Nearly 14 kms of this road passes through thick forest, which is home to elephants, tigers, leopards, black panthers and king cobras. Many sections of this road are critical wildlife corridors and are declared as Dandeli elephant reserve in the Govt. of Karnataka notification vide letter no. F.No.7-2/2012-PE dated 27-03-2015. The proposed road passes through a critical elephant corridor between Dandeli Wildlife Sanctuary and forests of Khanapur and Jamboti. This Elephant Reserve has been declared with its' buffer zones clearly mentioned. Kanhapur, Belgaum, Haliyal are divisions that are part of the buffer zone of elephant reserve as per this notification. As per F. No. 6-10/2011 WL dated December 2012, obtaining recommendations of the Standing Committee of NBWL under the Wild Life (protection) Act 1972 with respect to the areas, for which this process is mandatory under the law, and also in compliance to relevant Hon'ble Supreme Court orders. The copy of the notification is produced herewith as Annexure 'H'
- 16. It is also submitted that there are critical elephant corridors in this section that are the primary gateway of gene pool exchange for elephants in the Dandeli Wildlife Sanctuary. Disrupting elephant corridors have proven fatal in the past where it primarily triggers increased human-elephant conflicts in the region due to severe stress the pachyderms have to undergo for traversing through the disintegrated ancient routes. Any highspeed highway or railway lines have proven detrimental to the elephant population. It is impossible for large elephant herds to cross the wide roads with calves. Often, the calves get stuck in the divider and is exposed to speeding vehicles. Any 4 lane highway is built for vehicles speeding at 100 Km/ Hour. Elephants and other species like ungulates, reptiles will not be able to gauge the speed of the vehicle approaching to cross the wide road. These species will have to wait for hours before crossing the road and reaching out to areas with water availability. It is also in the interest of nearby farmers that projects with such deleterious impacts are avoided.

- 17.It is pertinent to note that wildlife all over the country where there has been large scale linear intrusion are facing severe threat due to speeding vehicles. Bandipur is an example where the night traffic through a National Highway has been banned by the Supreme Court considering the impact on wildlife. It is submitted that the Ministry of Environment and Forests have also issued Notification dated 4th October 2012 as per Annexure 'J' as a Protected area. In WP No 17498/2009 before this Hon'ble Court has espoused several important aspects pertaining to wildlife in the area in question and the need to preserve and protect the same from being indiscriminately exposed to risks of road traffic accidents from the heavy flow of traffic flowing through the national highways cutting across the Bandipur National Park and Tiger reserve. This area is also part of the Mysore Elephant Reserve as declared by the Ministry of Environment and Forests, Government of India, giving utmost importance to elephant conservation.
- 18.Night traffic restraints are there on all roads within Nagarhole National Park vide order dated 11-07-2008. It is submitted that a decision was taken by the monitoring committee that a 14 Kilometer diversion shall be taken up to completely avoid the usage of 10 Km of the existing Mysore-Manantavadi road passing through the Nagarhole National Park to ensure greater protection of wildlife of the region. The Hyderabad-Srisailam road passing through the NagarjunaSagar- Srisailam Tiger Reserve is also closed from 9 PM to 6 AM.
- 19.It is pertinent to note that critical wildlife corridors are the primary reason for imposing restrictions on traffic through National Highways.
- In WP No 17498/2009, the judgment order quotes "Apart from the fact that some of the animals are getting killed, there has been a change in their behaviour particularly in the case of elephants which venture to go into the neighbouring farmers' lands and villages leading to man animal conflict such as damage to the crop and other properties and human lives. The need for maintaining a peaceful atmosphere during night hours so as to enable the nocturnal animals

to have peaceful passage through forest area has made authorities to take steps to restrict the night traffic from 9PM to 6AM."

- 20.It is submitted that roads have also known to trigger severe man animal conflicts in the landscape when elephant herds have to wait for long hours to cross certain sections of the highway with their young calves. While Karnataka forest department is spending crores of money to mitigate human-elephant conflicts from the state exchequer, it is shocking to note that the department is considering to further fragment the landscape by approving large scale linear intrusion initiatives that create further conflicts. All these in spite of clear directions by the High Court of Karnataka for protection and conservation of elephant reserves through the "Elephant Suo Motto Case".
  - 21.Referring to the Elephant Suo Motto Case in the High Court of Karnataka W. P. No. 14O29 / 2OO8, upon the death of 25 elephants around Bandipur-Nagahole National Park, The Karnataka task force states that
  - a) "The elephant's penchant for feeding on cultivated crops brings it into direct conflict with people. The most obvious patterns and reasons of crop raiding, supported by the scientific studies, are the following:
    - a) The rapid loss of natural habitat through conversion to agriculture would result in escalated conflict as elephants continue to treat the converted land as part of their traditional home range. Habitat loss directly impacts only those clans or males within whose home ranges the changes have taken place.
    - b) The fragmentation of habitat increase the chances of this long-ranging species to make contact with cultivated land and indulge in crop raiding.
    - c) The elephants having tasted crops would continue to prefer this source of food, irrespective of the availability of natural forage in their habitat.
    - d) Sub-adult and adult male elephants typically have a higher propensity as
    - e) compared to female-led groups to raid crops by moving out from their native range.
    - f) Elephants may disperse from their native range due to local habitat pressures, significant reduction in forage through proliferation of

- unpalatable weeds or large-scale fire, overabundance in relation to carrying capacity, or adverse climatic events.
- g) Due to strong inter-clan hierarchies, the elephants tend to disperse into unoccupied areas which are general human use areas.
- b) Man-animal conflict is bound to be an inevitable issue to be dealt with by not only the experts in the field, but also by involving citizens. Large animals, such as elephants need extensive space to move, breed and feed. When their habitat is fast shrinking, they come in conflict with human beings. Human development interfering with the elephants' migratory paths, breeding grounds and core habitats, would result in an obvious conflict with the elephants. Elephants being migratory wild animals, they require large habitats connected by well-established movement paths called "corridors".
- c) It is found that man-elephant conflict could be addressed and mitigated in four ways: (1) Introducing barriers such as trenches, fences or repellents such as crackers, watcher squads etc., between the elephant and man; (2) Change in cropping patterns around elephant populated areas to include non-palatable crops, which do not attract elephants; (3) securing corridors for elephant movement; (4) Capture of rogue and problem herds. The first method is only a temporary solution and ought not to impede migration. The second and third measures are critical long-term measures that need to be pursued for finding a permanent solution to man-elephant conflict. The last measure should be resorted to only after identifying rogue animals which could be captured and translocated. The issue of translocation of herds of elephants from one habitat to another is a matter which would require careful and comprehensive consideration. Source: Law of Forests in India by R.N.Choudhary 3'dEdition.
- 22.It is submitted that in the write up called "Roadkill animals on national highways of Karnataka", as per Annexure 'K' published in Journal of Ecology and the Natural Environment by Wildlife Institute of India, Dehradun on 4 April, 2011 "Highways passing through national reserves/wildlife sanctuaries have adverse impact upon wild animals. The present survey was conducted to estimate the roadkills on the National Highways NH212 and NH67 passing through Bandipur Tiger Reserve, Karnataka, India during summer and pre-monsoon season at various vegetational levels. The roadkills were monitored thrice a month in each habitat between January, 2007 and June, 2007 and a total of 423 roadkills belonging to 29 species were recorded. Reptiles were the most affected taxa (37.59%)

followed by amphibians (29.55%), mammals (19.39%) and birds (13.48%). The variability in season indicated higher roadkills in pre-monsoon (55.6%) compared to those in summer season (44.6%). According to vegetation, the overall roadkill was 50% in mixed deciduous forest and 22.40% in the teak forest and bamboo. Conservation and management implications are essential to prevent the local extinct of faunal and floral."

23.It is submitted that the Basic Principle of MoEF's recommendation of the sub committee on guideline for roads in protected areas,F.No.6-62/2013 WL, Dated 22nd December 2014as per Annexure 'L'- states- "we wish to reiterate appoint articulated cleanly in the National Wildlife Action Plan 2002-2016, which states that the Ministry of Surface Transport to plan roads, highways, express ways in such manner that all National Parks and Sanctuaries are bypassed and integrity of the PA is maintained wildlife corridors also need to be avoided on mitigative measures need to be employed.

In planning roads, within and in the vicinity (defined here as roads that are situated inside and within I Km radial distance) of protected areas, we recommend that following fundamental principles must be followed in order of priority: Avoidance, Realignment, Restoration,

- 1, Principle of Avoidance: The foremost option would be to altogether avoid areas that are within or in the vicinity of any Protected Area and to find alternatives that are socially and ecologically more appropriate.
- 2, Principle of Realignment: This follows as a corollary of the first principle, Road projects must investigate and demonstrate that they have considered other alternative routes that avoid natural areas of high ecological value. This must be an integral feature of a project proposal and implementation documents, Realignments must also be developed in a transparent manner through consultation with local communities affected by the routing and subject to ecological and wildlife considerations, User agencies seeking clearances for roads must demonstrate as to how they have taken these factors into account, before their proposals can be considered for approval by the SC-NBWL.
- 3, Principle of Restoration: In natural areas, existing roads that are in disuse (e.g., old logging roads), or evaluated to be inefficient or detrimental to their objects, shall be targeted for decommissioning and subsequent ecological restoration, as the process of assisting the recovery of an ecosystem that has been degraded, damaged, or destroyed,

- It is further submitted that the Government of Karnataka has also issued Notification bearing No. FEE 362 FWL 2014 dated 26-03-2015 as per Annexure 'M' setting up of Dandeli Elephant Reserve spread over the districts of Uttara Kannada, Belgaum, Haveri and Dharwad.
  - 24. The Petitioners respectfully submit that in the absence of alternate and efficacious remedy is filing the Public Interest Litigation Writ Petition under Articles 226 and 227 of the Constitution of India.
  - 25. The Petitioners have not filed any other petition or petitions before this Hon'ble Court on the same cause of action and no other suits or proceedings are pending in any other court at the instance of the Petitioners.
  - 26. The Petitioners produce herewith Court Fee of Rs. 100/- as per Karnataka Court Fees and Suits Valuation Act.

# **GROUNDS**

- 27.It is respectfully submitted that the Respondent 3 is without getting clearance from the Wild Life Board and not acquiring the required land from the private parties as on today cannot destroy the Elephant Reserve and Dense forest in the District of Balgavi and surrounding districts for the purpose of widening the NH4-A.
- 28.It is respectfully submitted that the major evergreen trees are, AglaiamalabaricaSasidh. , BischofiajavanicaBlume ,Chionanthus mala-elengi (Dennst.) P. S. Green, (Mala ilanji) Garciniagummi-gutta (L.) Robs. , (Knemaattenuata (Hook. f. &Thoms.)Warb (Chorapali) Litsea floribunda (Blume) Gamble, AntidesmamontanumBlume, CulleniaexarillataRobyns, Bull.(Mllanpali) Melicopelunu-ankenda (Gaertn.) Hartley, Mallotustetracoccus (Roxb.)Kurz (Sindoori), Meliosmapinnata (Roxb.) Maxim. SyzygiumgardneriThw.,etc . Many of them coming under the category of Rare Endemic and Threatened plants (RET) (Nayar, 1996 &IUCN, 2000).
- Quoting from Hidden life of trees by Peter Wohlleben" For reaching sexual maturity, some trees have to reach 150 years of age. 8ft trees can be 80 years old and these 80 year old trees under a 200 years old mother tree might have to wait

for another 200 years to gain growth in a very dense forest. They grow fine hairs in tree roots to suck up moisture pairing with fungi – mycelium. Older the tree, the more quickly it grows." Many trees that are marked for cutting in these pristine tropical wet evergreen forests of Belgaum and Haliyal Divisions belongs to rare / endangered and threatened species. Many are lower girth size, which doesn't mean the trees are not old trees. No compensatory afforestation can conserve these floral species and the damaged eco system.

29.It is respectfully submitted that in the case of KM ChinnappaVs UOI -AIR 2003 SC 724 in paragraph 17 and 29, the Apex court dealing with Art 48A and Art51(A)(g) impose obligations on the State and the citizens of India to protect and improve the natural environment including forests, lakes, rivers and wildlife and to have compassion for living creatures. In paragraph 29, it is stated as under:

"The tide of judicial considerations in environmental litigations in India symbolises the anxiety of Court in finding out appropriate remedies for environmental maladies. At global level, the to live is now recognised as a fundamental right to an environment adequate for health and well being of human beings .... "

30.It is respectfully submitted that in the letter dated 21-11-2012 by Chief Conservator of Forests, it is stated that the approval shall be given subject to the approval of Chief Wildlife Warden and National Board of Wildlife. In the absence of consent letters from Chief Wildlife Warden and NBWL, it is a clear violation of Section 2 Forest Conservation Act where a 3<sup>rd</sup> party user agency is allowed to fell trees inside forest land.

31.It is respectfully submitted that the Government. ofIndia vide letterNo. F.No.7-2/2012-PE dated 27-02-2015 Elephant Reserve has approved and accordingly Government of Karnataka declared with its' buffer zones clearly mentioned. Kanhapur, Belgaum, Haliyal are divisions that are part of the buffer zone of elephant reserve. As per F. No. 6-10/2011 WL dated December 2012, obtaining recommendations of the Standing Committee of NBWL under the Wild Life

(protection) Act 1972 with respect to the areas, for which this process is mandatory under the law, and also in compliance to relevant Hon'ble Supreme Court orders.

32.It is respectfully submitted that as per the press information bureau published by Ministry of Road Transport and Highways as of 23<sup>rd</sup> Mar 2017, the four laning of National Highway is based on threshold traffic for 4-laning of NHs from 15,000; 11,000; and 8,000 Passenger Car Units (PCUs) per day to 10,000; 8,500 and 6,000 PCUs/day for Plain, Rolling, and Mountainous/Steep Terrains respectively. It is submitted that the Chief Conservator of Forests vide letter No:A7/LND/NHAI/FC/PRP/BGM/2012-13 dated 03-10-2012 states the current width of the road at 7m in forest area. The proposal to four lane the stretch inside forest area would mean widening a 7m existing road to as wide as 45 m. It is humbly submitted that in the backdrop of the geological fragility of the landscape of Western Ghats and the effect of recent floods in mountainous Kodagu, Wayanad and Idukki which are again on the Western Ghats clearly gives human induced green cover loss as a primary cause of landslides. It is important to highlight that though NHAI has a standard width procedure for road widening, it has to consider the fragility of the ecology of certain sections, wildlife movement, wildlife corridors and population density for widening. India is a thickly populated land with 4 big cats and many large mammalian species that needs a large terrain co existing in this landscape, unlike the Western World. A one size fits all model for development in India is a faulty approach considering we need to accommodate development by conserving the rich natural heritage of this country. It is highly unscientific to use the same width uniformly across all kinds of terrains, eco fragile lands, landslide prone areas and forest zones. Blasting and use of heavy machinery to remove large rock structures to widen roads in steep terrains has proven to have long lasting consequences on the stability of the land. NHAI by deforesting the landscape of its' century old mother trees with root structures that can run upto many kilometres are triggering a series of land instability issues in the terrain, thus putting both humans and animal species at severe risk during heavy rains.

#### **GROUNDS FOR INTERIM RELEIF**

33.It is respectfully submitted that the Respondent 3 is without getting clearance from the Wild Life Board and not acquiring the required land from the private parties as on today cannot destroy the Elephant Reserve and Dense forest in the District of Balgavi and surrounding districts for the purpose of widening the NH4-A.

34.It is respectfully submitted that the Government. of India vide letter No. F.No.7-2/2012-PE dated 27-02-2015 Elephant Reserve has approved and accordingly Government of Karnataka declared with its' buffer zones clearly mentioned. Kanhapur, Belgaum, Haliyal are divisions that are part of the buffer zone of elephant reserve. As per F. No. 6-10/2011 WL dated December 2012, obtaining recommendations of the Standing Committee of NBWL under the Wild Life (protection) Act 1972 with respect to the areas, for which this process is mandatory under the law, and also in compliance to relevant Hon'ble Supreme Court orders.

35.It is therefore prayed that this Hon'ble Court by way interim order restrain the 3<sup>rd</sup> Respondent from widening the roads under NH4-A which are passing through the Core, Reserve Forest and Elephant Reserve also Tiger Reserve falling under 4/6 lane (A) Belagavi Bypass(Western), BelagaviByepass (Eastern) and Notified Core Areas of Dandeli Wildlife Sanctuary, Buffer Area falling under Yallapur,Kriwatrtietc as notified by the Government of Karnataka vide Notification Bearing No.FEE 362 FWL 2014 dated 26-03-2015 as per Annexure 'M' pending disposal of the Writ Petition in the interest of justice and equity.

# <u>PRAYER</u>

36. The Petitioners therefore pray that this Hon'ble Court be pleased:

A.To issue an appropriate writ, order or direction, to stop illegal road widening under the Forest Conservation Act 1980 and Wildlife Protection Act 1972 undertaken by the 3<sup>rd</sup> Respondent in the Districts of Belagavi and surrounding districts.

B. To direct the respondents to adhere to the MoEF's recommendation of the sub committee on guideline for roads in protected areas, F.No.6-62/2013 WL, Dated

22nd December 2014as per Annexure 'L', and also that as principle of

Avoidance through forest areas and critical elephant corridors be followed and

retain existing road width in forest areas and allow only two lane roads.

C. To direct NHAI 3<sup>rd</sup> Respondent to maintain 50 Kmph speed limit with

intermittent speed breakers inside all wildlife corridors and forest areas (PAs

and Territorial divisions) to avoid death due to road kills.

D. To direct Karnataka Forest Department to ban night traffic through all Elephant

reserves as per directions of NBWL Standing Committee.

E. To grant such other reliefs as this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in

light of the facts and circumstances of the case in the interest of justice and

equity.

**INTERIM PRAYER** 

37. The Petitioners therefore pray that this Hon'ble Court by way interim order restrain

the 3<sup>rd</sup> Respondent from widening the roads under NH4-A which are passing through

the Core, Reserve Forest and Elephant Reserve also Tiger Reserve falling under 4/6

lane (A) Belagavi Bypass(Western), BelagaviByepass (Eastern) and Notified Core

Areas of Dandeli Wildlife Sanctuary, Buffer Area falling under Yallapur, Kriwatrtietc as

notified by the Government of Karnataka vide Notification Bearing No.FEE 362 FWL

2014 dated 26-03-2015 as per Annexure 'M' pending disposal of the Writ Petition in

the interest of justice and equity.

Bengaluru

Date:21-01-2019

Advocate for Petitioners