



SUPREME COURT BAR ASSOCIATION (Regd.)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA, TILAK MARKG, NEW DELHI-110001 (INDIA)

Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.)
President

Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.)
Vice President

Mr. Ashok Arora
Hony. Secretary
(Under Suspension)*

Mr. Rohit Pandey
Acting Hony. Secretary

Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey
Treasurer

Ms. Shamsravish Rein
Joint Treasurer

SENIOR EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)
Dr. Adish Chandra Aggarwala (Sr.)
Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)
Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)
Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)
Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)

EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
Ms. Anjali Chauhan
Ms. Prerna Kumari
Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
Mrs. Alka Agarwal
Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan

* Mr. Ashok Arora suspended from
the post of Hony. Secretary vide
EC resolution Dated 08.05.2020

SCBA/CJI.9/2020

10th July, 2020

Hon'ble Mr. Justice Sharad Arvind Bobde
Chief Justice of India
Supreme Court of India
New Delhi -110001

Your Lordship,

I have the privilege to bring to kind attention of Your Lordship the Executive Committee Resolution taken in its meeting held on 9th July, 2020 in the wake of sad and avoidable death of a very Senior Member of the Supreme Court Bar Association Shri S.K. Dhingra.

Our Association earnestly requests that necessary actions be taken in the larger interest of all the stakeholders.

We are assured of Your Lordship looking into the suggestions made by the Executive Committee.

With Regards,

Yours sincerely,


ROHIT PANDEY
Acting Hony. Secretary

Encl: Resolution of EC Meeting dated 09.07.2020

CC:

The Secretary General, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi.



SUPREME COURT BAR ASSOCIATION (Regd.)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA, TILAK MARKG, NEW DELHI-110001 (INDIA)

Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.)
President

Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.)
Vice President

Mr. Ashok Arora
Hony. Secretary
(Under Suspension)*

Mr. Rohit Pandey
Acting Hony. Secretary

Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey
Treasurer

Ms. Shamshravish Rein
Joint Treasurer

SENIOR EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)
Dr. Adish Chandra Aggarwala (Sr.)
Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)
Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)
Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)
Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)

EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
Ms. Anjali Chauhan
Ms. Perna Kumari
Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
Mrs. Alka Agarwal
Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan

* Mr. Ashok Arora suspended from
the post of Hony. Secretary vide
EC resolution Dated 08.05.2020

**MINUTES OF THE EMERGENT AND URGENT MEETING
OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE SUPREME
COURT BAR ASSOCIATION HELD ON 9TH JULY 2020 AT
5:15 PM ON THE ONLINE PLATFORM - ZOOM**

The following members were present:

1. Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.), President	11. Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
2. Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.), Vice President	12. Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
3. Mr. Rohit Pandey, Acting Hony. Secretary	13. Ms. Anjali Chauhan
4. Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey, Treasurer	14. Ms. Perna Kumari
5. Ms. Shamshravish Rein, Joint Treasurer	15. Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
6. Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)	16. Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
7. Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)	17. Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
8. Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)	18. Mrs. Alka Agarwal
9. Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)	19. Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan
10. Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)	

**MR. DUSHYANT A. DAVE (SR.), PRESIDENT
PRESIDED OVER THE MEETING**

On the morning of the 9th of July 2020 a message was received by the executive committee of the Supreme Court Bar Association from Mrs Shefali Mitra Dhingra daughter of Mr. S.K. Dhingra (both members of this Association) stating inter alia as under:

"Everything here is a sham, today I lost my father because the so called supreme court protocol would not let us get the car in from gate B, while I was begging the guards to let us in as he was having a massive cardiac arrest,



SUPREME COURT BAR ASSOCIATION (Regd.)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA, TILAK MARKG, NEW DELHI-110001 (INDIA)

Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.)
President

Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.)
Vice President

Mr. Ashok Arora
Hony. Secretary
(Under Suspension)*

Mr. Rohit Pandey
Acting Hony. Secretary

Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey
Treasurer

Ms. Shamskravish Rein
Joint Treasurer

SENIOR EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)
Dr. Adish Chandra Aggarwala (Sr.)
Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)
Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)
Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)
Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)

EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
Ms. Anjali Chauhan
Ms. Prerna Kumari
Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
Mrs. Alka Agarwal
Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan

* Mr. Ashok Arora suspended from
the post of Hony. Secretary vide
EC resolution Dated 08.05.2020

but they didn't Very blatantly we were told to go around and enter from the other gate wherein we all know we have to cross red lights.

Kept calling the so called emergency clinic, to ask if they can in the meantime send a doctor or at least a sorbitrate so that he could have been saved ,but somehow they said there is no doctor available and there was no Ambulance.... everything is a sham None of the staff in the adjoining chambers came around Have the people lost all compassion ,all commn sense...

These twenty minutes which we wasted could have saved him had there been a doctor around to give him a emergency medicine and take him to the nearest hospital.... We have lost a very senior advocate most of you have known him closely...Mr SK DHINGRA... he's been around for more than fifty five years and this is what he getsI will file a formal complaint in detail...

Who are we fooling, the whole thing is a sham. I'm am most disgruntled by my experience at supreme court...never imagined this is what I would ever have to witness here.

I lost my father because of the inefficiency of our so called emergency clinic, doctors and....

Shefali Mitra"

On receiving the aforesaid message the Executive Committee held an emergent an urgent meeting at 5:30 pm on the 9th of July 2020 to consider and initiate appropriate action on the content of the message. The meeting was held over the zoom platform.



SUPREME COURT BAR ASSOCIATION (Regd.)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA, TILAK MARKG, NEW DELHI-110001 (INDIA)

Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.)
President

Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.)
Vice President

Mr. Ashok Arora
Hony. Secretary
(Under Suspension)*

Mr. Rohit Pandey
Acting Hony. Secretary

Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey
Treasurer

Ms. Shamsravish Rein
Joint Treasurer

SENIOR EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)
Dr. Adish Chandra Aggarwala (Sr.)
Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)
Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)
Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)
Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)

EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
Ms. Anjali Chauhan
Ms. Prerna Kumari
Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
Mrs. Alka Agarwal
Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan

* Mr. Ashok Arora suspended from
the post of Hony. Secretary vide
EC resolution Dated 08.05.2020

In the meeting the members were informed that immediately on the receipt of the message Mr. Dushyant Dave, President SCBA spoke with the Secretary General of the Supreme Court of India expressing serious concern on this unfortunate and tragic incident within the immediate precincts of the Court. He sought an immediate inquiry into the incident expressing concern and shock that an event like this can occur happen in the premises of the Court. This call was duly followed up by the Vice President and the Acting Secretary. Mr Rohit Pandey and Mr. Meenesh Dubey called the SCBA staff on duty and met with the authorities of the Clinic located at Gate-B to ascertain the events/happenings of the 8th July when Mr. S.K. Dhingra lost his life. Mr. Dushyant Dave spoke to Mrs. Shefali Mitra Dhingra expressed his grief and offered condolences to the family on this terrible tragedy.

In the meeting various issues were raised by the members where despair and grief were expressed unanimously. Losing a member of the Association or any person within the immediate precincts of the Supreme Court because of callousness was a serious issue. Members expressed serious concern at the treatment and absence of facilities – both medical and logistic in the clinic and in the compound to meet such situations. Members referred to similar incidents in the past and opined that these issues must be remedied urgently. Immediate and long term measures were suggested to deal with such emergencies. The deliberations considered possible steps which could be taken to improve healthcare in emergent situations for all those who needed it in the precincts in order to prevent any such tragedy in the future within or in the immediate precincts of the Court.

The meeting, after discussion **RESOLVED** as follows:

1. The Executive Committee mourns the sad and tragic demise of Shri S. K. Dhingra an elder and respectable member of the SCBA on 8th July 2020. The Supreme Court Bar Association expresses its heartfelt condolences and pays that the family of the Late Mr. S.K. Dhingra to bear this terrible loss and have the strength and fortitude to bear this terrible tragedy.



SUPREME COURT BAR ASSOCIATION (Regd.)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA, TILAK MARKG, NEW DELHI-110001 (INDIA)

Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.)
President

Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.)
Vice President

Mr. Ashok Arora
Hony. Secretary
(Under Suspension)*

Mr. Rohit Pandey
Acting Hony. Secretary

Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey
Treasurer

Ms. Shamshravish Rein
Joint Treasurer

SENIOR EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)
Dr. Adish Chandra Aggarwala (Sr.)
Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)
Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)
Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)
Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)

EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
Ms. Anjali Chauhan
Ms. Prerna Kumari
Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
Mrs. Alka Agarwal
Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan

* Mr. Ashok Arora suspended from
the post of Hony. Secretary vide
EC resolution Dated 08.05.2020

2. The Executive Committee strongly condemn the callous failure of the staff of the Supreme Court at the Supreme Court Premises especially the security staff and the medical Personnel at the NDMC run clinic both under direct control and supervision, of the Registry of the Supreme Court.
3. The Executive Committee took note with deep sense of sadness, the events which unfolded on 8th July 2020 resulting in avoidable death of Shri S.K. Dhingra who neither received medical attention from any qualified staff nor was provided with life saving drugs in this emergency. The Executive Committee also noted that despite repeated requests by family members of Shri S.K. Dhingra, assistance was not forthcoming to help him nor was any ambulance available to take him to the hospital on emergency basis. His demise without getting adequate medical care from the clinic situated barely 100 metre from his chambers was a sad reflection on the facilities being provided in a clinic run by the government inside the premises of the Supreme Court of India.
4. The Executive Committee resolved to request the Hon'ble Chief Justice to direct the Registry of the Supreme Court that such unfortunate mishap does not recur in future and that medical facilities including ambulance, staff, equipment and lifesaving medicines will always be made available at the NDMC clinic or the CGHS clinic to help all needy persons from within the Supreme Court complex without delay. Further that that the clinic be upgraded and adequate medical facilities be made available including an ambulance and trained doctors with competent medical staff. In emergencies the facilities of the CGHS dispensary situated in the main building be extended to any person needing emergent treatment.
5. The Executive Committee resolved that in order to inform the general public of the medical facilities available, notice boards be put up at all prominent places of the Court about the location off clinics in the Supreme Court with contact numbers number for immediate access.

Phones: Off. : 23385900, 23384874 • Library-1 : 23385551, 82285552 • Library-2 : 23384150, 23381762

Library-4 : 23385615 • Ladies Bar : 23070443 • Lounge : 23070449 • Arbitration Room : 23072101 • Meeting Room : 23070264

• E-mail : scbaec@gmail.com • Website : www.scbaindia.org



SUPREME COURT BAR ASSOCIATION (Regd.)

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA, TILAK MARKG, NEW DELHI-110001 (INDIA)

Mr. Dushyant A. Dave (Sr.)
President

Mr. Kailash Vasdev (Sr.)
Vice President

Mr. Ashok Arora
Hony. Secretary
(Under Suspension)*

Mr. Rohit Pandey
Acting Hony. Secretary

Mr. Meenesh Kumar Dubey
Treasurer

Ms. Shamshravish Rein
Joint Treasurer

SENIOR EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Ms. Mahalakshmi Pavani (Sr.)
Dr. Adish Chandra Aggarwala (Sr.)
Mr. Chander Uday Singh (Sr.)
Mr. Arijit Prasad (Sr.)
Col. R. Balasubramanian (Sr.)
Mr. Anip Sachthey (Sr.)

EXECUTIVE MEMBERS :

Mr. Amrendra Kumar Singh
Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj
Ms. Anjali Chauhan
Ms. Perna Kumari
Ms. K.V. Bharathi Upadhyaya
Mr. Upendra Narayan Mishra
Mr. R. Anand Padmanabhan
Mrs. Alka Agarwal
Mr. Tanveer Ahmed Khan

* Mr. Ashok Arora suspended from
the post of Hony. Secretary vide
EC resolution Dated 08.05.2020

6. The Executive Committee further resolved to ensure that the SCBA will take necessary steps to procure and keep life saving drugs for emergencies in the office of the SCBA and other appropriate places in Chamber Blocks in consultation with doctors.
7. It was resolved to send copies of these meetings and the resolutions passed to the Chief Justice of India for his Lordships consideration.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

09.07.2020


ROHIT PANDEY
Acting Hony. Secretary