IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

#### PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE MR.S.MANIKUMAR

&

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE SHAJI P.CHALY

FRIDAY, THE 21ST DAY OF AUGUST 2020 / 30TH SRAVANA, 1942

W.P(C).No.9459 OF 2020(S)

#### **PETITIONER**:

ADV.M.S.VINEETH, AGED 49 YEARS S/O. LATE M.R.SREENIVASAN, 'SHREE NIVAS, JOSEPH ROAD, CALICUT-673 032, Ph: 9447637466 E-mail:msvineethadv@gmail.com

BY ADV. SRI.V.T.MADHAVANUNNI

#### **RESPONDENTS**:

1	THE SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF AYUSH AYUSH BHAWAN, B-BLOCK, GPO COMPLEX, INA, NEW DELHI-110 023 Ph.011-24651950. E-mail:secy-ayush@nic.in
2	STATE OF KERALA, REPRESENTED BY THE CHIEF SECRETARY, GOVT. OF KERALA, GOVT. SECRETARIAT, TRIVANDRUM-695 001 Ph:0471-2333147, 0471-2518181,
3	THE SECRETARY,DEPARTMENT OF AYUSH, GOVT. SECRETARIAT, TRIVANDRUM-695 001 Ph.0471-2328410, 0471-2518459, Mob:9446528400 E-mail:ayush@kerala.gov.in
	R1-2 BY SRI.P.NARAYANAN, SENIOR GOVT.PLEADER ADV. M.P.KRISHNAN NAIR ADV. SHRI.NANDAKUMAR K.

ADV. SRI.T.D.SUSMITH KUMAR SRI.P.NARAYANAN, SR.GP AND SR.G.P.SRI.SURIN GEORGE IPE FOR R2 AND R3

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING COME UP FOR ADMISSION ON 21.08.2020, THE COURT ON THE SAME DAY DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 2 ::

### **JUDGMENT**

Dated this the 21<sup>st</sup> day of August, 2020

### MANIKUMAR, CJ

Mr. M.S.Vineeth, the petitioner, a former Central Government Counsel, has filed the instant writ petition, as a Public Interest Litigation, seeking for a direction to the Secretary, Department of AYUSH, Government Secretariat, Trivandrum, respondent No.3, to ensure that the Homoeopathic Practitioners are immediately allowed to perform in accordance with Exhibit-P1 notification dated 6.3.2020.

2. Facts leading to the writ petition are as under:

No medical practitioner of Homoeopathic Medicine has come forward to prefer this writ petition. But, a lawyer has filed this writ petition. The practice of Homoeopathic system of medicine, in India, is controlled and regulated by the Ministry of AYUSH, Government of India. The Ministry of AYUSH has issued Exhibit-P1 notification with an Annexure, and it specifically states that the State Government shall take steps to adopt Homoeopathic system among other systems of medicines, in the fight against the menace of Coronavirus.

Petitioner has further stated that many other states have implemented the directions of the Union Ministry of AYUSH earlier. But, in Kerala, where there are Government Homoeopathic Centres almost in every village, the

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 3 ::

aforesaid notification is not yet implemented. According to the petitioner, if Homoeopathic medicines are given to all, more particularly to the people in highly affected districts, to those who are under observation, isolation and quarantine, this type of situation would not have happened. Now, the third respondent, the State Secretary of AYUSH, issued Exhibit-P4 order on 08.04.2020, approving Ayurveda system for prevention, mitigation and rehabilitation of COVID-19 patients. According to him, the Homoeopathic system, which had proven in the past its huge potential, cost, effectiveness and convenience when compared to other systems of medicine in controlling all sorts of epidemics, is still kept away. Since no action is taken by the respondents 2 and 3, in implementing Exhibit-P1 notification, petitioner has filed the present writ petition.

3. Pursuant to the directions of this Court on 12.08.2020, learned Senior Government Pleader has filed a statement along with Annexure R3(a) Government order dated 21.04.2020. Relevant parts of the said statement is extracted hereunder:

"A. It is stated that on receiving Exhibit-P1 notification, wherein certain advisories were forwarded from the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent Ministry of Ayush, the Government had formed an expert committee for charting protocols for treatment for the management of COVID-19. In the said guidelines issued by the Government, Homeo medicines were not included.

:: 4 ::

B. That the Government has approved the action plan of the Homeo department for giving Homeo medicines as prophylactic. However, the target population was not intended to include COID-19 patients or their contacts, or those people under quarantine. That as services related to public health, sanitation, hospitals and dispensaries are categories under Entry 6 of List II, and is the responsibility of the State, treatment and management protocols are worked out and approved at the State levels, based on the available clinical evidence and reports and also on the advice from experts in the respective fields.

C. That the Government of Kerala have drawn a detailed action plan outlining the strategies in Homeopathy, for prevention and management of COVID-19 vide Annexure-R3(a) G.O.(Rt) No.161/2020/Ayush dated 21-4-2020."

4. Learned Senior Government Pleader drew our attention to a judgment dated 30.3.2020 passed by a Hon'ble Division Bench of the Madras High Court in W.P. Nos.7416 and 7417 of 2020, wherein it was held as under:

"The essential prayer made in these petitions filed by Mr. K. Muthu Kumar Nayakar and Dr. K. M. Senthamizh Selvan of Ayush Medical Welfare Association (AIMA), Chennai is to direct the State Government to constitute a committee to consider the representations of these persons / societies or associations to allow the authorised medical practitioners and others to provide relief and help to the Corona affected people and others, as preventive

:: 5 ::

measures or treatment or curative measures in the form of Alternative Medicines by way of Ayurveda / Siddha / Unani / Homeopathy or Naturopathy methods, besides Allopathy, which is commonly used.

In view of the Technical Committee already having been constituted for this purpose during the present times of COVID 19 or Corona Virus spreading world over, we direct the said Committee to consider all the concerned representations made in regard to the State Government for prevention and treatment of the said disease and also for the other measures like Alcoholic and Non-alcoholic Hand Sanitizers and other types of Sanitizers, Soaps and Mask of various types, which can be provided or supplied to the people at large, for meeting the said emergency of COVID-19. We hope and expect that the said Committee and the State Government shall take appropriate decisions in this matter as quickly as possible, so that the public at large can avail the benefit of the same, immediately."

5. Learned Senior Government Pleader further submitted that in yet another Writ Petition (MD) No.6570 of 2020 filed by Dr. S. Subramanian, B.S.M.S., against Union of India represented by Health and Family Welfare Department and others, a direction has been given to constitute a Committee of Experts to consider providing the alternative medicine, besides allopathy. For the above said reasons, he prayed for dismissal of the writ petition.

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 6 ::

6. Heard learned counsel for the respective parties and perused the material on record.

7. Government of Manipur in order dated 30.01.2020 (Exhibit-P3), issued by the Director (AYUSH), Directorate of AYUSH, Lamphelpat, have stated as under:

## "GOVERNMENT OF MANIPUR DIRECTORATE OF AYUSH, LAMPHELPAT <u>O R D E R</u>

### Imphal, the 30<sup>th</sup> January, 2020

No. B AYUSH/PH/DAS-2018. In view of the outbreak of Coronavirus repeatedly spreading to many of the countries including India. The Ministry of AYUSH Government of India has adopted Homoeopathic Medicine Arsenicum Album 30 as prophylactic Medicine against the Coronavirus infection. Therefore, the Medical Superintendent (s) and all the M.O.(c(s) of the different AYUSH institutions working under this Directorate are informed to distribute the Medicine as a preventive measure from the infection of the Coronavirus in the prescribed dose as per protocol of the Government of India, Ministry of AYUSH to the General Public as below:

### Arsenicum Album – 30 4 (four) pills once daily in empty stomach for 3 (three) days.

The dose may be repeated after 1 (one) month by following the same schedule in case Coronavirus infection prevailed in the community.

(Dr. Y. Lukhol Singh) Director (AYUSH)

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 7 ::

Directorate of Ayush, Lamphelpat" 8. Let us consider what the Government of India, Ministry of AYUSH,

New Delhi, have instructed the State Governments/Union Territories:

"SECRETARY GOVERNMENT OF INDIA MINISTRY OF AYURVEDA, YOGA & NATUROPATHY UNANI, SIDHA, SOWA-RIGPA AND HOMOEOPATHY (AYUSH) AYUSH BHAWAN, B-BLOCK, GPO COMPLEX INA, NEW DELHI-110023 Tel : 011-24651950, Fax : 011-24651937 E-mail : secy-ayush@nic.in D.O. No. S.16030/18/2019-NAM Dated : 06<sup>th</sup> March, 2020

As you are aware, incidences of Corona Virus (Covid-19) have been reported worldwide and 30 positive cases of Corona Virus have also been reported in India till date. Even though there is no panic response warranted, AYUSH being one of the important Ministry equipped for providing appropriate response to the circumstances arose due this public health challenge, it is worthwhile to associate with other Stakeholders in eliciting AYUSH based public health response considering the strength and evidences of these systems. In the past also, interventions under AYUSH systems had been varyingly used for making an effective public health response in similar situations faced in any States/UTs.

Keeping in view, the Ministry of Ayush with the recommendations from Research Councils under its administrative control has come out with an advisory (copy enclosed as Annexure – I) which may be communicated/implemented through AYUSH personnel and facilities as per the prevailing system of medicine in your State/UT.

These interventions from different AYUSH systems of medicine are supported with evidence for promotion of immunity and help in improving the respiratory symptoms in similar diseases. In this regard, a separate list of references is also enclosed at Annexure – II for your ready reference.

Therefore, I request you to do the needful for appropriate roll out of

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020

:: 8 ::

this strategy in consultation with other stakeholder departments responsible for Public Health in your State/UT.

Encl: as above

Yours Sincerely,

Sd/-(Rajesh Kotecha)

То

Chief Secretaries of all States/UTs

Copy to :

- 1. Principal Secretary AYUSH/Health of all State/UTs
- 2. Director/Commissioner/Mission Director (AYUSH) of all States/UTs.

### ADVISORY FROM MINISTRY OF AYUSH FOR MEETING THE CHALLENGE ARISING OUT OF SPREAD OF CORONAVIRUS (COVID-19) IN INDIA

Corona viruses (CoV) are a large family of viruses that cause illness ranging from the common cold to more severe diseases such as Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS-CoV) and Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS-CoV). The new Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) was first reported from Wuhan, China, on 31 December 2019. 72 countries reported COVID-19 incidence with 90,870 confirmed cases and 3112 deaths as per WHO fact sheet as on 03.03.2020. As on 03.03.2020, 05 confirmed cases are reported in India from various parts.

Common signs of infection include fever, cough, myalgia, fatigue and breathing difficulties. In more severe cases, infection can cause pneumonia, severe acute respiratory syndrome, kidney failure and even death.

The function of the immune system is critical in the human response to infectious disease. Viral infections induce oxidative stress and cause damage to airway epithelial cells. A growing body of evidence identifies stress, nutrition and immunity as a cofactor in infectious disease susceptibility and outcomes. The mainstay in management of corona viral infections has been supportive care, nutrition and preventing further progression in the absence of any antiviral agent or vaccine.

During Ebola outbreak in 2014 expert group of WHO has recommended that "it is ethical to offer unproven interventions with as yet unknown efficacy and adverse effects, as potential treatment or prevention" keeping in view no vaccine or anti-virals were available.

### Approach of AYUSH systems:

The holistic approach of AYUSH systems of medicine gives focus on prevention through lifestyle

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 9 ::

modification, dietary management, prophylactic interventions for improving the immunity and simple remedies based on presentations of the symptoms.

For instance, emphasis on avoidance of causative factors and enhancing the immunity against host of infections are characteristics of Ayurveda management. The preventive aspect of Homoeopathy is well known, and historically, Homoeopathy has reportedly been used for prevention during the epidemics of Cholera, Spanish Influenza, Yellow fever, Scarlet fever, Diphtheria, Typhoid etc. The genus epidemicus (GE) is the remedy found to be most effective for a particular epidemic once data have been gathered from several cases. It was reported that, during recent past GE had been used during various disease outbreaks for preventing the spreading of diseases like Chikungunya, Dengue Fever, Japanese Encephalitis and Cholera with good results. As detailed accounts of use of homoeopathy in control of epidemics are given in recent publications.

The AYUSH approach to manage the outbreak broadly comprise of:

- i. Preventive and prophylactic
- ii. Symptom management of COVID-19 like illnesses
- iii. Add on Interventions to the conventional care

Based on potential & strength of AYUSH systems supported by evidences for promotion of immunity and help in improving the respiratory symptoms in similar diseases and as per the recommendations from the research councils under Ministry of AYUSH following system wise approach is recommended:

### i. Preventive and prophylactic:

### Ayurveda:

Samshamani Vati 500 mg. twice a day with warm water for 15 days The medicine contains aqueous extract of *Tinospora cordifolia*.

### Siddha:

Nilavembu Kudineer decoction 60 ml. twice a day for 14 days. The medicine contains aqueous extract of *Andrographis paniculata* & others.

### Unani:

Preparation of decoction by boiling Behidana (*Cydonia oblonga*) 3 gm, Unnab (*Zizyphus jujuba*) 5 in number. Sapistan (Cordia myxa) 9 in number in water. (Boil these in *250*ml water- boil it till it remains half- filter it — keep in a glass bottle and use it lukewarm). The drugs used in the preparation of this decoction have been reported to have Antioxidant activity, Immuno-modulatory,

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 10 ::

antiallergic, smooth muscle relaxant activity and Anti-influenza activity. This decoction may be taken twice a day for *14* days.

### Homoeopathy:

Arsenicum album 30, daily once in an empty stomach for three days. The dose should be repeated after one month by following the same schedule till Coronavirus infections prevalent in the community.

In one of the studies Arsenic album as one of the constituents in a formulation affected HT29 cells and human macrophages. Also, it showed ..NF-KB hyperactivity (reduced expression of reporter gene GFP in transfected HT29 cells), ...TNF-a release in macrophages. Arsenic album is a common prescription in the cases of respiratory infections in day to day practice.

### ii. Symptom management of COVID-19 like illnesses

### Ayurveda

- 1. AYUSH-64 : 02 tablets twice a day
- 2. Agasthya Hareetaki : 05 gm twice a day with warm water
- 3. Anuthaila/Sesame oil 02 drops in each nostril daily in the morning

### Siddha

1. Nilavembu Kudineer/Kaba Sura Kudineer— decoction 60m1 twice a day

2. Adathodai Manapagu — Syrup 10 ml twice a day

### Homoeopathy

Various medicines which found to be effective in treating flu like illness are Arsenicum album, Btyonia alba, Rhus toxico dendron, Belladonna Gelsemium Eupatorium perfolia tum.

All these medicines should be taken in consultation with qualified physicians of respective AYUSH systems.

### 3. Add on Interventions to the conventional care

### Ayurveda

1. A YUSH-64 : 02 tablets twice a day

### W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 11 ::

- 2. Agastya Hareetaki: 05 gm twice a day with warm water
- 3. Siddh
  - 1. Vishasura Kudineer: decoction 60m1 twice a day
  - 2. Kaba Sura Kudineer decoction 60m1 twice a day

### Homoeopathy

Medicine mentioned Symptom management of COVID-19 like illnesses" under subhead Homoeopathy can also be given as add on to conventional care.

All these medicines should be taken in consultation with qualified physicians of respective AYUSH systems.

### General preventive measures (already notified):

- i. Observe good personal hygiene.
- ii. Practice frequent hand washing with soap.
- iii. Follow respiratory etiquettes cover your mouth when coughing or sneezing.

iv. Avoid close contact with people who are unwell or showing symptoms of illness, such as cough, runny nose etc.

- v. Avoid contact with live animals and consumption of raw/undercooked meats.
- vi. Avoid travel to farms, live animal markets or where animals are slaughtered.
- vii. Wear a mask if you have respiratory symptoms such as cough or runny nose.

### In addition, the following AYUSH specific measures may be adopted:

The diet should be fresh, warm, easy to digest, containing whole cereals, seasonal vegetables etc. Frequent sipping of water boiled with Tulsi leaves, crushed ginger, and turmeric would be beneficial. Honey with a pinch of pepper powder is also beneficial in case of a cough. Cold, frozen and heavy foods may be best avoided. It is always beneficial to avoid direct exposure to cold breeze. Appropriate rest and timely sleep are advisable.

The practice of Yogasana and Pranayama under the guidance of qualified Yoga instructors is recommended.

Common medicinal plants useful in similar symptoms are Tulsi (*Ocimum sanctum*), Guduchi (*Tinospora cordifolia*), Ginger (*Zingiber officinale*) and Turmeric (*Curcuma longa*)"

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 12 ::

9. Government of Kerala issued G.O.(Rt) No.156/2020/AYUSH dated 08.04.2020 (Exhibit-P4), approving the action plan outlining the Ayurveda Strategies for prevention, mitigation and rehabilitation of COVID-19 patients in Kerala, which is extracted hereunder:

### **"GOVERNMENT OF KERALA**

### Abstract

AYUSH Department – COVID-19 - Action Plan outlining the Ayurveda Strategies for prevention, mitigation and rehabilitation of COVID-19 patients in Kerala – approved orders-issued.

-----

### AYUSH(B) DEPARTMENT

G.O.(Rt)No.156/2020/AYUSH Dated, Thiruvananthapuram, 08/04/2020 Read:- 1.Minutes of the Video conference of Hon'ble Chief Minister with Ayurveda Experts on 30.03.2020.

#### ORDER

1. As per the decisions taken in the meeting of Hon'ble Chief Minister read as 1st paper above, Government are pleased to approve the Action Plan outlining the Ayurveda Strategies for prevention, mitigation and rehabilitation of COVID-19 patients in Kerala as appended to this order.

2. Ayurvedic COVID-19 response cells [State Ayurveda COVID-19 Response Cell (SACRC), Regional Ayurveda COVID-19 Response Cell (RACRC) and District Ayurveda COVID-19 Response Cell (DACRC)] will be constituted shortly.

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 13 ::

(By order of the Governor)

### DR. SHARMILA MARY JOSEPH IAS SECRETARY"

10. Government of Kerala has issued an order dated 21.04.2020 [Annexure-R3(a)], approving the action plan outlining the Homeopathy Strategies for prevention and management of COVID-19 in Kerala, which reads as under:

### **"GOVERNMENT OF KERALA**

Abstract

AYUSH Dept. – COVID-19 - Action Plan outlining the Homeopathy Strategies for Prevention, and Management of COVID-19 in Kerala – Approved - Orders issued.

\_\_\_\_\_

### AYUSH(B) DEPARTMENT

G.O.(Rt)No.161/2020/AYUSH Dated, Thiruvananthapuram, 21/04/2020 Read:- 1. Letter No. DHTVM/2606/2019-P2 dtd. 13.04.2020 of the Director of Homeopathy.

### ORDER

In the circumstances explained by the Director of Homeopathy vide letter read above, Government are pleased to approve the Action Plan outlining the Homeopathy Strategies for prevention and management of COVID-19 in Kerala as appended to this order.

(By order of the Governor)

Bhooshan V.,

Additional Secretary"

### STRATEGIES FOR THE PREVENTION & MANAGEMENT OF COVID-19 IN KERALA THROUGH HOMOEOPATHY

#### **ACTION PLAN**

Component	Details	Responsible authority
	Situation Analysis by High Power Committee -*RAECH	
	State level Monitoring and evaluation COVID-19 preventive activities by SLEG RAECH	The Department of AYUSH, DH, PCO.
Strategy	District level Monitoring and evaluation COVID-19 preventive activities by DLEG RAECH	
	Equipping Special team (including medical and paramedical workers) in districts and in Homoeopathic Medical colleges)	
Setting up of Communication platform	Establishment of a state level official communication network for the effective execution of the recommended framework within and among the various levels of the framework (Various conferencing platforms and others)	NAM
Establishing necessary linkages	Urgent intimation and integration of the newly formed organisational framework with the public health mechanism of the state and the relevant components of LSGD institutions for smooth running of the same.	The Department of AYUSH
Preparedness and readiness	Imparting training, awareness and sensitization of essential components for the special team, medical & paramedical staff. (Training can be done through virtual online platforms)	DHS, PCO, DH and NAM
	Ensuring support and coordination with local public health mechanisms and LSGD institutions	PCO, DH and NAM

:: 15 ::

Implementation of the	The first meeting of the High power committee will be prioritizing programmes for immediate implementation for prevention of Covid-19 in Kerala	Department of AYUSH, PCO, DH
programme	Initiation of activities of District level committees and Special Clinics via virtual meetings and ensuring readiness and preparedness for implementation	SLEG
Target population	Generic population of state**	
Distribution of Homoeopathy immune booster	Throughout the state through Homoeopathy institutions under DH, PCO	DH, PCO, NAM, NHM & LSGD Department

\* The Govt of Kerala sanctioned the Project of Rapid Action Epidemic Control Cell Homoeopathy (RAECH), Kerala, as per GO(Rt) No.2543/04/H&FWD dtd 07/09/2004. All Epidemic Control Measures are being initiated, monitored and controlled under the supervision of RAECH by distributing preventive medicines, conducting medical camps, health awareness programmes and seminars throughout the State, wherever epidemics break out. Initially the RAECH was structured to meet the Epidemic Control activities but the design can also be utilised even to handle the pandemic situation. Hence the structure of RAECH is sufficient to meet the current Pandemic.

\*\* Target population does not include COVID-19 patients or their contacts or those under quarantine

- ✓ DLEG can forward suggestions upon which SLEG can make decisions on the Homeopathic Immune Booster (HIB).
- ✓ Homeopathic Immune Booster (HIB) will be supplied free of cost to the target population through government homoeopathic institutions under the supervision of District Medical Officer (Homoeo), District Programme Manager (NAM) and DLEG.
- ✓ An efficacy study can be conducted as per the recommendation of Government in a selected district on the Homoeopathic Immunity

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020

:: 16 ::

Booster Medicine (HIB) for data formulation and analysis as per the norms of ICMR, Department of Homoeopathy, National Homoeopathy Research Institute in Mental Health Govt. of India, and Principal and Controlling Officer.

- ✓ The Homoeopathy Department has been implementing many programmes to address various health issues to maintain a better health standard of all strata in the society and to mould a healthy community during the pandemic.
  - a) SADGAMAYA Adolescent Health Care and Behavioural Management Programme.
  - b) SEETHALAYAM Women Health Care Centre
  - c) PUNARJANI De-addiction treatment
  - d) CHETANA Pain and Palliative Care & Geriatric
  - e) AYUSHMAN BHAVA AYUSH Holistic Centre for Prevention and Management of Life Style Diseases.
  - f) JANANI Mother and Child care
  - g) Nisarga Speciality clinic for Transgender
  - h) Other speciality clinics for various conditions

Public can use the peripheral institutions to have primary service of entire specialty units or can also have telephonic consultation. With the limited public transport and other conveyance facilities department focus to give more importance to the Pain & Palliative care and Geriatric care programmes. Districts have already developed mechanism for home delivery of medicines for the needy.

11. Exhibit-P1 notification is a D.O letter dated 06.03.2020, addressed to the Principal Secretary, AYUSH/Health of all States/UTs and Director/Commissioner/Mission Director (AYUSH) of all States/UTs. Annexure to the said subject speaks about the approach of AYUSH systems to manage the outbreak of Covid-19 which comprise of:

I. Preventive and prophylactic

:: 17 ::

II.Symptom management of COVID-19 like illnesses

III. Add on interventions to the conventional care

12. Insofar as the above three heads, annexure further speaks about presumption of mixtures and some tablets.

13. It is the case of the petitioner that Exhibit-P1 has not been implemented by the State of Kerala, whereas it is the submission of learned Senior Government Pleader that Government has approved the action plan of Homeo Department for giving Homeo medicines as prophylactic. However, the target population was not intended to include COVID-19 patients or their contacts or those people, under guarantine. Advisory of the Ministry of AYUSH is being followed by the Government and tablets are given free of cost to those persons as immunity boosters. As per the State Medical Protocol, COVID-19 affected persons should not be treated by anybody other than the Government and those authorised by the Government. As per the medical protocol of the Government, doctors practising in AYUSH medicines are not supposed to prescribe any medicines, stating that it is curative for COVID-19 disease. However, as per the advisory, there is nothing prohibiting the qualified medical AYUSH practitioners to prescribe immunity booster mixture or tablets, as suggested by the Ministry of AYUSH, Government of India, New Delhi. When the Central as well as State Governments have approved prescription of certain mixtures and tablets, as immunity boosters, gualified

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 18 ::

medical practitioners in AYUSH can also prescribe the same, but only as immunity boosters.

14. We also make it clear that if any qualified doctor practising AYUSH medicine, makes any advertisement or prescribes any drugs or medicines, as a cure for COVID-19 disease, except those specifically mentioned in Annexure-I advisory to Exhibit-P1 D.O. letter dated 6.3.2020, it is open for the respondents to take appropriate action under the provisions of the Disaster Management Act, 2005, and the orders of the Governments, both Central as well as the State, issued from time-to-time. Only those tablets or mixtures shall be given as immunity booster and not as cure for COVID-19. AYUSH medical practitioners are further directed not to violate the dated 6.3.2020. Government Order In this regard, Medical/Police Departments are also directed to monitor the action of AYUSH medical practitioners.

Writ petition is disposed of accordingly.

SD/-S. MANIKUMAR, CHIEF JUSTICE

SD/-SHAJI P. CHALY, JUDGE

Rv/jes

W.P.(C) No. 9459 of 2020 :: 1 ::

#### APPENDIX

#### PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS:

- EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION NUMBERED D.O.NO.S 16030/18/2019-NAM DATED 06.03.2020 WITH ANNEXURE ISSUED BY THE FIRST RESPONDENT TO THE CHIEF SECRETARIES OF ALL STATES.
- EXHIBIT P2 TRUE INTERNET COPY OF THE REPORT PUBLISHED IN THE MATHRUBHOOMI ONLINE DATED 06.04.2020 AT 2 PM.
- EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER ISSUED ON BEHALF OF THE MANIPUR GOVERNMENT DATED 30.01.2020.
- EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE AFORESAID ORDER, G.O. (RT) NO.156/2020/AYUSH DATED 08.04.2020 ISSUED BY THE THIRD RESPONDENT.
- EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER NO.G.O.(RT) NO.161/2020/AYUSH, DATED 21.04.2020 ISSUED ON BEHALF OF AYUSH (B) DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT OF KERALA.
- EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER ISSUED BY EDAPPAL GRAMA PANCHAYATH TO MEDICAL OFFICER, HOMEO, EDAPPAL DATED 17.07.2020 ALONG WITH ENGLISH TRANSLATION.
- EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER ISSUED BY CHAIRPERSON, PANDALAM MUNICIPALITY TO DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICER (HOMEOPATHY), PATHANAMTHITTA DATED 18.07.2020 ALONG WITH ENGLISH TRANSLATION.
- EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER NO.36/KGHMOA SC 2019-21 DATED 29/4/2020 ISSUED ON BEHALF OF KERALA GOVERNMENT HOMOEO MEDICAL OFFICERS' ASSOCIATION TO THE MINISTER FOR AYUSH HEALTH GOVERNMENT OF KERALA ALONG WITH ENGLISH TRANSLATION.

#### RESPONDENT'S EXHIBITS

ANNEXURE R3(a) THE TRUE COPY OF THE GOVERNMENT ORDER G.O. (RT)NO.161/2020/AYUSH DATED 21.4.2020.

// TRUE COPY //

P.S. TO JUDGE