ITEM NO.47 Court 4 (Video Conferencing)

**SECTION PIL-W** 

## SUPREME COURT OF INDIA RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

SMW(C) No(s).7/2020

IN RE: THE PROPER TREATMENT OF COVID 19 PATIENTS AND DIGNIFIED HANDLING OF DEAD BODIES IN THE HOSPITALS ETC.

(WITH APPLICATION FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING ORIGINAL VAKALATNAMA/OTHER DOCUMENT, APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS, CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION, EARLY HEARING APPLICATION, EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT, EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., EXEMPTION FROM PAYING COURT FEE, INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT, PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON, PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)

WITH

SLP(C) No. 6381-6382/2021 (III)

(FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.55834/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT and IA No.55832/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.55837/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT)

SLP(C) No. 7546/2021 (III)

(FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.67199/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT and IA No.67200/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T., IA No. 82286/2021 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION, IA No. 82870/2021 - MODIFICATION OF COURT ORDER)

SLP(C) No. 7690/2021 (III)

(FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.67482/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT and IA No.67483/2021-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.67481/2021-PERMISSION TO FILE PETITION)

Date: 27-08-2021 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM:

HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE D.Y. CHANDRACHUD

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE M.R. SHAH

For Petitioner(s)

By Courts Motion, AOR

SLP 6381-82/2021 Mr. Dushyant Dave, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR Ms. Karishma Maria, Adv. Ms. Neha Sangwan, Adv.

SLP 7690/2021 Mr. Ankur Saigal, Adv

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv Mr. Keyur Gandhi, Adv Mr. Kunal Vyas, Adv Mr. Rishabh Parikh, Adv Mr. E.C. Agrawala, AOR

SLP 7546/2021

Mr. Huzefa Ahmadi, Sr. Adv. Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv. Mr. Keyur Gandhi, Adv. Mr. Ankur Saigal, Adv. Mr. Kunal Vyas, Adv. Mr. Rishabh Parikh, Adv. Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

For Respondent(s)

UOI

Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG Mr. K.M. Nataraj, ASG

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv. Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv. Mr. Saurabh Mishra, Adv. Mr. Mohd. Akhil, Adv.

Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, AOR

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Prashant Singh 'B', Adv.

Andhra Pradesh

Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.

Mr. Shaik Mohamad Haneef, Adv. Mr. T. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.

Mr. Amitabh Sinha, Adv.

Mr. K.V. Girish Chowdary, Adv.

Arunachal Pradesh Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR

Ms. Eliza Bar, Adv.

Assam Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR

Mr. Kabir Shankar Bose, Adv.

Bihar Mr. Azmat Hayat Amanullah, AOR

Goa Mr. Arun Pedneker, Adv.

Mr. Sachin Patil, AOR

Gujarat Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG

Ms. Manisha Lavkumar, Sr. Adv. Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR

Mr. Satyam Chaya, Adv. Ms. Aastha Mehta, Adv.

Haryana Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR

Ms. Archana Preeti Gupta, Adv. Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv. Mr. Avdhesh Kumar Singh, Adv.

Ms. Rita Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Deepshikha Bharti, Adv.

Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR

Himachal Pradesh Mr. Himanshu Tyagi, AOR

Jharkhand Mr. Kumar Anurag Singh, Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Jain, Adv. Mr. Anando Mukherjee, AOR Mr. Shwetank Singh, Adv.

Karnataka Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, AOR

Mr. Ashish Yadav, Adv. Mr. Rakshit Jain, Adv. Mr. Vishal Banshal, Adv.

Kerala Mr. G. Prakash, AOR

Ms. Priyanka Prakash, Adv. Ms. Beena Prakash, Adv.

Madhya Pradesh Mr. Mirza Kayesh Begg, Adv.

Mr. Pashupati Nath Razdan, Adv.

Mr. Rohit K. Singh, Adv.

Ms. Maitreyee Jagat Joshi, Adv.

Maharashtra Mr. Rahul Chitnis, Adv.

Mr. Sachin Patil, AOR

Mr. Aaditya A. Pande, Adv.

Mr. Geo Joseph, Adv.

Manipur Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR

Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv. Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.

Meghalaya Mr. Amit Kumar, Adv. Gen.

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR Mr. Aditya Shankar Pandey, Adv.

Mizoram Mr. Siddhesh Kotwal, Adv.

Ms. Ana Upadhyay, Adv. Ms. Manya Hasija, Adv.

Ms. Pragya Barssaiyan, Adv. Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR

Nagaland Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv. Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.

Odisha Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Punjab Mr. Atul Nanda, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Uttara Babbar, AOR Mr. Manan Bansal, Adv.

Rajasthan Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR

Sikkim Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Verma, Adv. Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR

Tamil Nadu Dr. Joseph Aristotle S., AOR

Ms. Preeti Singh, Adv.

Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.

Mr. D. Kumanan, AOR

Mr. Sheikh Fakhrudeen Kalia, Adv.

Telangana Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR

Ms. Sweena Nair, Adv.

Tripura Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR

Mr. Kabir Shankar Bose, Adv.

Uttar Pradesh Ms. Garima Prashad, Sr. Adv./AAG

Mr. Vishnu Shankar Jain, AOR

Uttarakhand Mr. Atul Sharma, AOR

West Bengal Mr. Suhaan Mukerji, Adv.

Mr. Vishal Prasad, Adv.

Mr. Nikhil Parikshith, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Manchanda, Adv.

Mr. Sayandeep Pahari, Adv.

M/s. PLR Chambers & Co.

A&N Islands Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.

Ms. G. Indira, AOR

Mr. M.K. Mondal, Adv.

Mr. P. Gandeepan, Adv.

Chandigarh Mr. Gurinder Singh Gill, Sr. Adv.

Mr. P.P. Nayak,, Adv.

Mr. Kuldeep Singh Kuchaliya, Adv.

Ms. Aashna Gill, Adv.

Mr. Pratap Singh Gill, Adv.

Mr. Bhupinder, Adv.

Ms. Vandana Hooda, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR

NCT of Delhi Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR

Daman & Diu Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG

Mr. Kanu Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.

Mr. Prashant Singh 'B', Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR

Mr. Amrish Kumar, Adv.

J & K

Mr. G.M. Kawoosa, Adv.

Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR

**Puducherry** 

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR

Mr. A.Lakshminarayanan, Adv.

Mr. Biju P Raman, AOR

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Ashish Wad, Adv.

Mrs. Tamali Wad, Adv.

Mr. Sidharth Mahajan, Adv.

Ms. Sukriti Jaggi, Adv.

Mr. Ajeyo Sharma, Adv.

M/s. J S Wad & Co.

Mr. Parijat Kishore, AOR

Mr. M. Yogesh Kanna, AOR

Mr. Manoj V George, Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Luthra, Adv.

Ms. Bhavika, Adv.

Mr. Ranjit Philip, Adv.

Ms. Shilpa Liza George, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, AOR

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, Adv.

Mr. Hussain Mueen Farooq, Adv.

Ms. B. Sudha, Adv.

Mr. Mohd. Kamran Khan, Adv.

Mr. Bikash Kumar Sinha, Adv.

Ms. Reeta, Adv.

Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR

Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, AOR

Mr. Nalin Kohli, Adv.

Mr. Sidharth Sethi, AOR

Mr. Avinash Das, Adv.

Mr. Rohit Anil Rathi, AOR

Mr. Roshan Santhalia, AOR

Mr. Pranjal Kishore, Adv.

Mr. M.P. Vinod, AOR

Ms. Aswathi M.K., AOR

Applicant-in-person

Mr. Awanish Sinha, AOR

Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR

Ms. Karishma Maria, Adv.

Ms. Pratima N. Lakra, AOR

Ms. Taruna Ardhendumauli Prasad, AOR

Mr. Parth Awasthi, Adv.

Ms. Deepika Gupta, Adv.

## UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following $O\ R\ D\ E\ R$

On 8 July 2021, a notification has been issued by the Government of Gujarat in the Urban Development and Urban Housing Department. The notification which was issued purportedly in exercise of the power conferred by Section 122 of the Gujarat Town Planning and Urban Development Act 1976 contains the following directions:

"The buildings that do not have valid building use permission OR are in breach of building use permission OR have violated development control regulations such as change of use, margin, height restrictions etc., the owners/occupiers of such buildings shall immediately take corrective measures to comply with the development control regulations and shall comply with the same within a period starting from today till three months from the last day of applicability of the Gujarat Epidemic Diseases, COVID-19 Regulations, 2020. While all the Municipal Corporations/ Nagarpalikas/Urban Development Authorities/ Area Development Authorities shall take proactive appropriate measures to increase compliance of Building Use permission, however, no coercive action shall be taken against such buildings for breach of development control regulations from today till three months from the last day of applicability of the Gujarat Epidemic Diseases, COVID-19 Regulations, 2020."

2 Section 122 of the Gujarat Town Planning and Urban Development Act 1976,

## WWW.LIVELAW.IN

7

which has been invoked for issuing the notification, is in the following terms:

- "122. Control by State Government. (1) Every appropriate authority shall carry out such directions or instructions as may be issued from time to time by the State Government for the efficient administration of this Act.
  - (2) If in, or in connection with, the exercise of its powers and discharge of its functions by any appropriate authority under this Act any dispute arises between the authority and the State Government, the decision of the State Government on such disputes shall be final."
- The power which is vested in the State Government under Section 122 is to facilitate the efficient administration of the Town Planning and Urban Development Act. As a consequence of the notification dated 8 July 2021, the State Government has directed that:
  - (i) Buildings which do not have valid building use permission; or
  - (ii) Buildings which are in breach of building use permission; or
  - (iii) Buildings which have violated development control regulations, such as change of use, margins and height restrictions;

shall be exempt from the obligation to comply with the building control regulations for a period of three months from the last date of the applicability of the Gujarat Epidemic Diseases Covid-19 Regulations 2020. Though the notification states that in the meantime corrective measures shall be adopted to comply with the Regulations, within a period of three months, directions have been issued to all the local bodies in the State of Gujarat to take no coercive measures.

4 Prima facie, the notification dated 8 July 2021 is *ultra vires* the provisions of Section 122. Such an exemption from complying with the building control

WWW.LIVELAW.IN

8

regulations which have been validly framed under the town planning legislation

bears no nexus with the efficient administration of the Act. Granting exemptions

from complying with development control regulations which are made in the

public interest to promote the health, safety and welfare of citizens defeats the

letter and purpose of the legislation. Condoning the gross irregularities in

constructing buildings which do not have building use or, as the case may be,

fire permissions, has resulted in violation of the law to the detriment to public

health as is evident from the incidents of fire which have taken place both in

Rajkot and Bharuch. The State of Gujarat shall take pro-active steps to ensure

that the rule of law is observed. Consequently, pending further orders, the

enforcement of the notification dated 8 July 2021 shall be held in abeyance by

the State of Gujarat.

6 List the matters after three weeks.

SLP (C) No 7546 of 2021

1 We are not inclined to entertain the Special Leave Petition under Article 136 of

the Constitution. The judgment of the High Court suffers from no error.

2 The Special Leave Petition is accordingly dismissed.

3 Interim order shall stand vacated.

4 Pending applications, including applications for intervention, stand disposed of.

(SANJAY KUMAR-I) AR-CUM-PS (SAROJ KUMARI GAUR)
COURT MASTER